



Council of the
European Union

Brussels, 4 December 2015
(OR. en)

14888/15

**Interinstitutional File:
2013/0408 (COD)**

LIMITE

**DROIPEN 162
COPEN 340
CODEC 1637**

NOTE

From:	Presidency
To:	Delegations
No. prev. doc.:	14470/15
Subject:	Proposal for a Directive of the European Parliament and of the Council on procedural safeguards for children suspected or accused in criminal proceedings - Preparation of discussions in Coreper

Introduction

Following the Working Party on 27 November, the Presidency had technical meetings with the European Parliament and with the Commission on 2 and 3 December. The Presidency also had some bilateral contacts with Member States, and had contacts with the Council Legal Service.

Various Member States also made very helpful comments on an informal draft of the Presidency.

In the light of these meetings, contacts and comments, the Presidency established the text as set out in the Annex. Subject to refinements by delegations at the Working Party on 8 December, the Presidency intends sending this text to the meeting of Coreper on 10 December. Coreper will be invited to agree to submitting this text as an overall compromise text to the European Parliament in view of the 9th trilogue on 15 December 2015 (Strasbourg).

Comments

Article 2

- Paragraph 3

EP finds this text not strong enough. Some Member States have signalled that they would like to make it more flexible. Presidency thinks that the current text strikes a good balance.

- Paragraph 6

This paragraph has been replaced with recital 11d. EP prefers the current text (which was formerly in a footnote).

Article 6

The Council Legal Service (CLS) voiced concerns about the compatibility of the text as it stood with the ECHR and the relevant case law of the ECtHR.

CLS recommended inserting a reference to Directive 2013/48/EU, which EP now also seems to accept.

CLS also suggested taking out references to "deprivation of liberty" in paragraphs 5 and 6. As a consequence, these paragraphs have been merged.

Further, on request by EP, paragraph 4a has been put in the recitals; compare recital 20 in Directive 2013/48/EU.

Paragraph 8 has been made stronger, with a reference to the offences listed in FD EAW. EP is still scrutinising this paragraph, and the accompanying recitals.

Paragraph 9 has been put in paragraph 5; EP insists on it, and after the fusion of paragraphs 5 and 6, this seems to make more sense.

The Presidency considers that the Article as it currently stands is overall acceptable. Some questions remain, though:

- EP wants "mandatory" before assistance in paragraph 5. According to the Presidency, since there is no waiver foreseen, this is not necessary, and could lead to confusion. EP insists however; would it be acceptable?
- EP insists on putting "sanction" instead of "criminal sentence". Presidency has suggested two alternatives to EP. This point remains difficult to explain, though.
- Recital 16: the last addition by EP on "legal aid", is it acceptable in the context of a broader compromise? ¹
- Recital 16c, comparable to recital 21 of Directive 2013/48/EU: EP changed the last part. Is it acceptable?

Article 9

The circumstances, which can lead the authorities to decide not to make an audio-visual recording because it would not be proportionate, have been listed as an open way.

¹ Presidency suggested substitution of the last words with "or the obligations of Member States under the ECHR to ensure the right to a fair trial, including legal assistance from a lawyer" (see recital 18 of Directive 2013/48/EU), but this did not satisfy EP.

Article 12

This Article, with the accompanying recitals 25-26e, has been further refined. The Presidency considers that it is now quite a balanced text.

Article 17

In this Article on the EAW, EP would like to add references to Articles 10, 11, 12 (complete), 15 and 18. Would this be (partily) acceptable, in a spirit of compromise?

Childs' best interests

Presidency signalled to EP that the text very often refers to the child's best interests. EP recognised this, but insisted to having these references, which would "compensate" for the derogations and exceptions by the Council.

Conclusion

The Presidency understands that this document arrives very late, but hopes nevertheless that Member States can duly examine it.

The Presidency calls upon Member States to show maximum flexibility so as to allow reaching an agreement before the end of the year.

DRAFT COMPROMISE TEXT

(draft)

DIRECTIVE OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL
on procedural safeguards for children suspected or accused in criminal proceedings

THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND THE COUNCIL OF THE EUROPEAN UNION,

Having regard to the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union, and in particular Article 82(2)(b) thereof,

Having regard to the proposal from the European Commission,

After transmission of the draft legislative act to the national Parliaments,

Having regard to the opinion of the European Economic and Social Committee²,

Having consulted the Committee of the Regions³,

Acting in accordance with the ordinary legislative procedure,

² Opinion of 25 March 2014.

³ See renunciation letter of 14 April 2014.

Whereas:

- (1) The purpose of this Directive is to establish procedural safeguards to ensure that children who are suspected or accused in criminal proceedings are able to understand and follow those proceedings, to enable such children to exercise their right to a fair trial and to prevent re-offending by children and foster their social integration.
- (2) By establishing minimum rules on the protection of procedural rights of suspects or accused persons, this Directive should strengthen the trust of Member States in the criminal justice systems of other Member States and can thus help improve mutual recognition of decisions in criminal matters. Such common minimum rules should also remove obstacles to the free movement of citizens throughout the territory of the Member States.
- (3) Although the Member States are parties to the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child, experience has shown that this in itself does not always provide a sufficient degree of trust in the criminal justice systems of other Member States.
- (4) **On 30 November 2009, the Council adopted the Roadmap for strengthening the procedural rights of suspected or accused persons in criminal proceedings ('the Roadmap').⁴ Taking a step-by-step approach, the Roadmap calls for the adoption of measures regarding the right to translation and interpretation (measure A), the right to information on rights and information about the charges (measure B), the right to legal advice and legal aid (measure C), the right to communicate with relatives, employers and consular authorities (measure D), and special safeguards for suspected or accused persons who are vulnerable (measure E). The Roadmap emphasises that the order of the rights is indicative, implying that it may be changed according to priorities. It is designed to operate as a whole; only when all its components are implemented will its benefits be felt in full. (AM 2)**

⁴ OJ C 295, 4.12.2009, p. 1.

- (4a) **On 11 December 2009, the European Council welcomed the Roadmap and made it part of the Stockholm programme — An open and secure Europe serving and protecting citizens (point 2.4).⁵ The European Council underlined the non-exhaustive character of the Roadmap, by inviting the Commission to examine further elements of minimum procedural rights for suspects and accused persons, and to assess whether other issues, for instance the presumption of innocence, need to be addressed, in order to promote better cooperation in that area. (AM 3)**
- (5) Three measures have been adopted to date, namely Directive 2010/64/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council⁶, Directive 2012/13/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council⁷ and Directive 2013/48/EU of the European Parliament and the Council.⁸
- (6) This Directive promotes the rights of the child, taking into account the Guidelines of the Council of Europe on child-friendly justice.
- (7) Children who are suspects or accused in criminal cases should be given special attention in order to preserve their potential for development and reintegration into society.

⁵ OJ C 115, 4.5.2010, p.1.

⁶ Directive 2010/64/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 20 October 2010 on the right to interpretation and translation in criminal proceedings (OJ L 280, 26.10.2010, p.1).

⁷ Directive 2012/13/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 22 May 2012 on the right to information in criminal proceedings (OJ L 142, 1.6.2012, p.1).

⁸ Directive 2013/48/EU of the European Parliament and the Council of 22 October 2013 on the right of access to a lawyer in criminal proceedings and European arrest warrant proceedings and on the right to have a third party informed upon deprivation of liberty, and to communicate with third persons and with consular authorities (OJ L 294, 6.11.2013, p. 1).

- (8) This Directive should apply to children, meaning persons under the age of 18, who are (...) suspected or accused of having committed a criminal offence. In respect of children subject to European arrest warrant proceedings, the relevant provisions of this Directive should apply from the time of their arrest in the executing Member State.
- (9) **This Directive, or certain provisions thereof, should also apply to suspects or accused persons subject to criminal proceedings, and to persons subject to European arrest warrant proceedings, where these persons were children when they became subject to the proceedings, but subsequently have become of age, and the application is appropriate in the light of all the circumstances of the case, including the maturity and vulnerability of the person concerned.**
- (10) When, at the time a person becomes a suspect or accused person in criminal proceedings, that person is above the age of 18, but **the offence has been committed when the person was a child**, Member States are encouraged to apply the procedural safeguards foreseen by this Directive until this person reaches the age of 21, **at least as regards offences that are committed by the same suspect or accused person and that are jointly investigated and prosecuted as they are inextricably linked to offences where criminal proceedings started against that person before the age of 18.**
- (11) Member States should determine the age of children on the basis of the children's own statements, checks of their civil status, documentary research, other evidence and, if such evidence is unavailable or inconclusive, on the basis of a medical examination. **A medical examination should be carried out as a last resort and in strict compliance with the child's rights, physical integrity and human dignity. Where a person's age is still in doubt, that person should, for all purposes, be presumed to be a child.** (AM 10)
- (11a) **The application of this Directive should be excluded in respect of some minor offences. However, such exclusion should not be made where the suspect or accused person is deprived of liberty; in such situation, the Directive shall in any case fully apply, in accordance with its provisions.**

- (11b) In some Member States an authority other than a court having jurisdiction in criminal matters has competence for imposing sanctions other than deprivation of liberty in relation to relatively minor offences. That may be the case, for example, in relation to traffic offences which are committed on a large scale and which might be established following a traffic control. In such situations, it would be unreasonable to require that the competent authorities ensure all the rights under this Directive. Where the law of a Member State provides for the imposition of a sanction regarding minor offences by such an authority and there is either a right of appeal or the possibility for the case to be otherwise referred to a court having jurisdiction in criminal matters, this Directive should therefore apply only to the proceedings before that court following such an appeal or referral.**
- (11c) In some Member States certain minor offences, in particular minor traffic offences, minor offences in relation to general municipal regulations and minor public order offences, are considered to be criminal offences. In such situations, it would be unreasonable to require that the competent authorities ensure all the rights under this Directive. Where the law of a Member State provides in respect of minor offences that deprivation of liberty cannot be imposed as a sanction, this Directive should therefore apply only to the proceedings before a court having jurisdiction in criminal matters.**
- (11d) This Directive should only apply to criminal proceedings; it should not apply to other types of proceedings, in particular proceedings which are specially designed for children and which could lead to protective measures, corrective measures or education measures.**

- (12) This Directive should be implemented taking into account the provisions of Directive 2012/13/EU and Directive 2013/48/EU. (...) This Directive provides further complementary safeguards with regard to information to be provided **to children and** to the holder of parental responsibility in order to take into account the specific needs **and vulnerabilities** of children. (AM 11)
- (12a) Children should receive information about general aspects of the conduct of the proceedings. To that end, children should notably be given a brief explanation about the next procedural steps in the proceedings, in so far as this is possible in the light of the interest of the criminal proceedings, and about the role of the authorities involved. The information to be given should depend on the circumstances of the case.**
- (12b) Children should receive information in respect of the right to a medical examination at the earliest appropriate stage in the proceedings, it being understood that this will be at the latest upon deprivation of liberty if such a measure is taken in relation to the child.**
- (13) If a child is deprived of liberty, the Letter of Rights provided to the child pursuant to Article 4 of Directive 2012/13/EU should include clear information on the child's rights under this Directive.
- (14) (deleted)
- (15) Member States should also inform the holder of parental responsibility about applicable procedural rights, either orally or in writing. The information should be provided as soon as possible and in such detail as is necessary to safeguard the fairness of the proceedings and the effective exercise of the rights of the child.**

- (15a) **In certain circumstances, which can also relate to only one of two persons holding parental responsibility, the information should be provided to another appropriate adult nominated by the child and accepted as such by the competent authority. Such circumstances could be the situation where objective and factual circumstances indicate or give rise to the suspicion that providing information to the holder of parental responsibility could substantially jeopardise the criminal proceedings; this could in particular be the case when evidence might be destroyed or altered, witnesses might be interfered with, or the holder of parental responsibility might have been involved in the alleged criminal activity together with the child.**
- (15b) **When the circumstances, which led the competent authorities to provide information to another appropriate adult instead of to the holder of parental responsibility, have ceased to exist, any information that the child receives in accordance with this Directive, and which is still relevant in the course of the proceedings, should be provided to the holder of parental responsibility. This should not unnecessarily prolong the criminal proceedings.**

- (16) **Children who are suspected or accused of having committed a criminal offence have the right of access to a lawyer in accordance with Directive 2013/48/EU. Since children are vulnerable and are not always able to fully understand and follow criminal proceedings, they should be assisted by a lawyer in the situations set out in this Directive. In these situations, Member States should arrange for a lawyer to assist the child concerned, when such lawyer has not been arranged by the child itself or by a holder of parental responsibility, and they should provide legal aid when this is necessary to ensure that the child is effectively assisted by a lawyer. Assistance by a lawyer under this Directive presupposes that the child has the right of access to a lawyer under Directive 2013/48/EU. Therefore, where the application of a provision of Directive 2013/48/EU would make it impossible for the child to be assisted by a lawyer under this Directive, such provision should not apply to the right for children to have access to a lawyer under Directive 2013/48/EU. On the other hand, the derogations and exceptions to assistance by a lawyer laid down in this Directive should not affect the right of access to a lawyer in accordance with Directive 2013/48/EU, or the right to legal aid in accordance with the Charter, the ECHR, and with national and EU law.**
- (16a) **The provisions in this Directive on assistance by a lawyer should apply without undue delay once children are made aware that they are suspected or accused of having committed a criminal offence. For the purposes of this Directive, assistance by a lawyer means that the child is provided with legal support by the lawyer and that the child is represented by the lawyer during the criminal proceedings. When the child has to be assisted in accordance with this Directive during questioning, a lawyer has to be present. However, assistance by a lawyer does not necessarily mean that a lawyer has to be present during each investigative or evidence-gathering act. This does not prejudice the right of the child to have access to a lawyer during such acts, if the child has the right of access to a lawyer in accordance with Directive 2013/48/EU.**

- (16b) Provided this is in conformity with the right to a fair trial, the obligation for Member States to provide assistance by a lawyer, as set out in this Directive, does not include the following situations: to identify the child; to verify the possession of weapons or other similar safety issues; to carry out certain exams, checks or tests, such as a body check, a physical examination, a blood-, alcohol or similar test, taking photographs or fingerprints; or to bring the child to appear before a competent authority or to surrender the child to a holder of parental responsibility or to another appropriate adult, in accordance with national law.**
- (16c) Where a child, other than a suspected or accused child, such as a witness, becomes a suspected or accused child, that child should be protected against self-incrimination and has the right to remain silent, as confirmed by the case-law of the European Court of Human Rights. This Directive therefore makes express reference to the practical situation where such a child becomes a suspected or accused child during questioning by the police or by another law enforcement authority in the context of criminal proceedings. Where, in the course of such questioning, a child other than a suspected or accused child becomes a suspected or accused child, questioning should be suspended until the child is assisted by a lawyer in accordance with this Directive.**
- (17) Provided this is in conformity with the right to a fair trial and with the minimum rights set out in Directive 2013/48, Member States may derogate from the obligation to provide assistance by a lawyer when this is not appropriate in the light of the circumstances of the case, including the seriousness and the complexity of the case and the measures that could be taken in respect of the alleged offence, it being understood that the best interests of the child should always be a primary consideration. In any event, children should be assisted by a lawyer when they are brought before a competent court or judge in order to decide on detention at any stage of the proceedings within the scope of this Directive, as well as during detention. Moreover, [a custodial sentence should not be imposed] [deprivation of liberty should not be imposed as a criminal sentence], unless the child has been assisted by a lawyer. Member States should take practical arrangements in this respect.**

(17a) Member States should be permitted to derogate temporarily from the obligation to provide assistance by a lawyer in the pre-trial phase where there is an urgent need to avert serious adverse consequences for the life, liberty or physical integrity of a person, or where immediate action by the investigating authorities is imperative to prevent substantial jeopardy to criminal proceedings in relation to an offence as referred to in Article 2(2) of Framework Decision 2002/584/JHA, inter alia with a view to obtaining information concerning the alleged co-perpetrators of a serious crime, or in order to avoid that important evidence regarding a serious crime is lost. During a temporary derogation for one these compelling reasons, the competent authorities may question children without the lawyer being present, provided that they have been informed of their right to remain silent and can exercise that right, and provided that such questioning does not prejudice the rights of the defence, including the privilege against self-incrimination. Questioning may be carried out for the sole purpose and to the extent necessary to obtain information that is essential to avert serious adverse consequences for the life, liberty or physical integrity of a person, or to the extent necessary to obtain information that is essential to prevent substantial jeopardy to criminal proceedings. Any abuse of this derogation would in principle irretrievably prejudice the rights of the defence.

(17b) Member States should clearly set out in their national law the grounds and criteria for this temporary derogation, and they should make restricted use thereof. Any temporary derogation should be proportional, should be strictly limited in time, should not be based exclusively on the type or the seriousness of the alleged offence, and should not prejudice the overall fairness of the proceedings. Member States should ensure that where the temporary derogation has been authorised by a competent authority which is not a judge or a court, the decision on authorising the temporary derogation can be assessed by a court, at least during the trial stage. Member States should ensure that where a temporary derogation has been authorised under this Directive by a judicial authority or by another competent authority, which is not a judge or a court, the decision on authorising the temporary derogation can be assessed by a court, at least during the trial stage.

- (17c) Confidentiality of communication between children and their lawyer is key to ensuring the effective exercise of the rights of the defence and is an essential part of the right to a fair trial. Member States should therefore respect the confidentiality of meetings and other forms of communication between the lawyer and the child in the context of the assistance by a lawyer provided for in this Directive, without derogation. This Directive is without prejudice to procedures that address the situation where there are objective and factual circumstances giving rise to the suspicion that the lawyer is involved with the child in a criminal offence. Any criminal activity on the part of a lawyer should not be considered to be legitimate assistance to children within the framework of this Directive. The obligation to respect confidentiality not only implies that Member States should refrain from interfering with or accessing such communication but also that, where children are deprived of liberty or otherwise find themselves in a place under the control of the State, Member States should ensure that arrangements for communication uphold and protect confidentiality. This is without prejudice to any mechanisms that are in place in detention facilities with the purpose of avoiding illicit enclosures being sent to detainees, such as screening correspondence, provided that such mechanisms do not allow the competent authorities to read the communication between children and their lawyer. This Directive is also without prejudice to procedures under national law according to which forwarding correspondence may be rejected if the sender does not agree to the correspondence first being submitted to a competent court.**
- (17d) This Directive should be without prejudice to a breach of confidentiality which is incidental to a lawful surveillance operation by competent authorities. This Directive should also be without prejudice to the work that is carried out, for example, by national intelligence services to safeguard national security in accordance with Article 4(2) of the Treaty on European Union (TEU) or that falls within the scope of Article 72 TFEU, pursuant to which Title V on an area of Freedom, Security and Justice must not affect the exercise of the responsibilities incumbent upon Member States with regard to the maintenance of law and order and the safeguarding of internal security.**

- (18) (deleted)
- (19) Children who are suspected or accused in criminal proceedings should have the right to an individual assessment to identify their specific needs in terms of protection, education, formation and social integration, to determine if and to what extent they would need special measures during the criminal proceedings and to determine the extent of their criminal responsibility and the adequacy of a penalty or educative measure for them.
- (19a) The individual assessment should in particular take into account the personality and maturity of the child, their economic, social and family background, including their living environment, as well as any specific vulnerabilities of the child, such as learning disabilities and communication difficulties.**
- (19b) The extent and detail of an individual assessment might be adapted according to the circumstances of the case, taking into account the seriousness of the alleged offence and the measures that could be taken if the child is found guilty of the alleged offence. An individual assessment which has been carried out with regard to the same child in the recent past might be used if it is updated.**
- (19c) The competent authorities should take information deriving from an individual assessment into account when determining whether any specific measure concerning the child is to be taken, such as providing any practical assistance, assessing the appropriateness and effectiveness of any precautionary measures in respect of the child, such as decisions on provisional detention or alternative measures, and taking account of the individual characteristics and circumstances of the child when taking any decision or course of action in the context of the criminal proceedings, including when sentencing. Where an individual assessment is not yet available, this should not prevent the competent authorities from taking such measures or decisions, provided the conditions set out in this Directive are respected, including that the individual assessment should take place at the earliest appropriate stage of the proceedings. The appropriateness and effectiveness of the measures or decisions that have been taken previously might be re-examined when the individual assessment has become available.**

- (19d) The individual assessment should take place at the earliest appropriate stage of the proceedings and in due time so that the information deriving from the individual assessment can be taken into account by the prosecutor, a judge, or other competent authority before presentation of the indictment in view of the trial. In the absence of an individual assessment the indictment might nevertheless be presented, provided this is in the best interests of the child. This could be the case, for example, when a child is in pre-trial detention and waiting for the individual assessment to become available would risk to unnecessary prolong such detention.**
- (19e) Member States should be able to derogate from the obligation to carry out an individual assessment, if a derogation is warranted by the circumstances of the case, taking into account, inter alia, the seriousness of the alleged offence and the measures that could be taken if the child is found guilty of the alleged offence, and provided the best interests of the child are taken into account. In this context, all relevant elements should be taken into consideration, including whether or not the child has in the recent past been the subject of an individual assessment in the context of criminal proceedings, or whether the case is one which may be conducted without an indictment.**
- (20) The duty of care towards suspected or accused children underpins a fair administration of justice, notably when children are deprived of liberty and are therefore in a particular weak position. In order to ensure the personal integrity of a child who is deprived of liberty, the child should have access to a medical examination. Such medical examination should be carried out by a physician, either on initiative of the competent authorities, in particular when specific health indications give reasons for such examination, or in response to a request of the child or the holder of parental responsibility, or of the child's lawyer. Member States should lay down practical arrangements concerning medical examinations that are to be carried out in accordance with this Directive, and concerning access by children to such examinations. Such arrangements could inter alia address situations when two or more requests for medical examinations are made in respect of the same child in a short period of time.**

- (21) In order to ensure sufficient protection of children who are not always able to understand the content of interviews to which they are subject, to avoid any challenge of the content of an interview and thereby undue repetition of questioning, questioning **by police or other law enforcement authorities** of children (...) should be audio-visually recorded **unless it is not proportionate to do so, taking into account inter alia whether a lawyer is present or not, whether the child is deprived of liberty or not, and the best interests of the child.** This Directive does not require Member States to make **audio-visual** recordings of questioning of children by a judge or a court. (...)
- (21a) When an audio-visual recording is to be made in accordance with this Directive, but an **insurmountable** technical problem renders it impossible to make such recording, the police or other law enforcement authorities may question the child without an audio-visual recording **provided reasonable efforts have been made to overcome the technical problem and it is not appropriate to postpone the questioning, the best interests of the child being taken into account.** (...)
- (22) (deleted)
- (23) **In all circumstances, whether the questioning of children is audio-visually recorded or not,** questioning should be carried out in a manner that takes into account the age and level of maturity of the children concerned.
- (24) (deleted)

- (25) Children are in a particularly vulnerable position **when they are deprived of liberty**. Special efforts should be undertaken to avoid **deprivation of liberty and, in particular, detention of children at any stage of the proceedings before the final determination by a court of the question whether the child concerned has committed the offence, given the possible risks for their physical, mental and social development, and because it may hamper their reintegration in society. Member States may take practical arrangements, such as guidelines or instructions to police officers, on the application of this provision to situations of police custody. In any case, the provision should be without prejudice to the possibility for police officers, or other law enforcement authorities, to apprehend a child *in flagrante delicto*.**
- (25a) The competent authorities should **always** consider alternative measures **instead of detention** and **should have recourse to** such measures whenever **possible**. Such **alternative measures could include a prohibition for the child to be in certain places or an obligation for the child to reside in a specific place, restrictions of contact with specific persons, reporting obligations to the competent authorities, participation in therapeutic or addiction programmes subject to the child's consent, and participation in educational programmes.**
- (25b) Detention of children should be subject to a periodic review by a court, which could also be a single judge. The periodic review may be carried out either *ex officio* by the court, or at the request of the child, of the child's lawyer or of a judicial authority which is not a court, in particular a prosecutor. Member States should lay down practical arrangements in this respect, **including regarding the situation when a periodic review has already being carried out *ex officio* by the court and the child or the child's lawyer requests to carry out such a review.**

- (26) When children are detained they should benefit from special protection measures. In particular they should be held separately from adults unless it is considered in the child's best interest not to do so, in accordance with Article 37(c) of the United Nations Convention of the Rights of the Child. When a detained child reaches the age of 18 years, there should be the possibility to continue the separate detention where warranted, taking into account the individual circumstances of the case. Particular attention should be paid to the way detained children are treated given their inherent vulnerability. Children should have access to educational facilities according to their needs.
- (26a) **Member States should also ensure that children who are kept in police-custody are held separately from adults, unless it is considered in the child's best interests not to do so, or unless in exceptional circumstances it is not possible in practice to do so, the child's best interests being taken into account. For example, in large, sparsely populated areas children may exceptionally be held in police-custody with adults if this is in the best interest of the child. In such situations, particular vigilance should be required on the part of competent authorities in order to protect the physical integrity and well-being of the child.**
- (26b) Children may be detained with young adults **unless this is contrary to the best interests of the child.** Member States should determine which persons are considered to be young adults in accordance with their national law and procedures. Member States are encouraged to determine that persons older than 24 years cannot qualify as young adults.
- (26c) **When children are in detention, Member States should take appropriate measures as set out in this Directive. Such measures should inter alia ensure effective and regular exercise of the right to family life. Children should have the right to maintain regular contacts with parents, family and friends through visits and correspondence, unless exceptional restrictions are required in the best interests of the child or in the interests of justice.**

- (26d) Member States should also take appropriate measures to ensure respect for the freedom of religion or belief of the child. In this regard, Member States should, in particular, refrain from interfering with the religion or belief of the child. (AM 24)
- (26e) Where appropriate, Member States should also take appropriate measures in other situations of deprivation of liberty. The measures taken should be proportionate and appropriate to the nature of the deprivation of liberty, such as policy custody or detention, and to the duration of the deprivation of liberty.**
- (27) Professionals in direct contact with children should take into account the particular needs of children of different age groups and should take care that the proceedings are adapted to them. For that purpose, they should be specially trained in dealing with children.
- (27a) Children should be treated in a manner appropriate to their age, their special needs, their maturity and level of understanding, and bearing in mind any communication difficulties they may have.
- (28) Taking into account the differences between the legal traditions and systems between the Member States, the privacy of children during criminal proceedings should be ensured in the best possible way with a view, inter alia, to facilitating the re-integration of children into society. Member States should provide that court hearings involving children are ordinarily held in the absence of the public, or they should allow courts or judges to decide to hold such hearings in the absence of the public. This should be without prejudice to judgments being pronounced publicly in accordance with Article 6 ECHR.

- (29) **Children should have the right to be accompanied by the holder of parental responsibility during court hearings in which they are involved. If two persons hold parental responsibility for the same child, the child should have the right to be accompanied by both persons, unless this is not possible in practice despite reasonable efforts having been made by the competent authorities. Member States should lay down practical arrangements for the exercise by children of the right to be accompanied by the holder of parental responsibility during court hearings in which they are involved and concerning the conditions under which an accompanying person can be temporarily excluded from court hearings. Such arrangements could inter alia address the situation when the holder of parental responsibility is temporarily not available to accompany the child or when the holder does not want to make use of the possibility to accompany the child, it being understood that the arrangements should take the best interests of the child into account.**
- (29a) **In certain circumstances, which can also relate to only one of two persons holding parental responsibility, the child has the right to be accompanied during court hearings by an appropriate adult other than the holder of parental responsibility. One of these circumstances is where the child being accompanied by the holder of parental responsibility could substantially jeopardise the criminal proceedings. This could in particular be the case where objective and factual circumstances indicate or give rise to the suspicion that evidence may be destroyed or altered, witnesses may be interfered with, or the holder of parental responsibility may have been involved with the child in the alleged criminal activity.**
- (29b) **In the circumstances and under the conditions set out in this Directive, children should also have the right to be accompanied by the holder of parental responsibility during other stages of the proceedings at which the child is present, e.g. during police questioning.**

- (30) The right of an accused person to appear in person at the trial is based on the right to a fair trial provided for in Article 6 of the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, as interpreted by the European Court of Human Rights. **Member States should take appropriate measures to incentivise children to attend their trial, including by summoning them in person and by sending a copy of the summons to the holder of parental responsibility or, where that would be contrary to the best interests of the child, to another appropriate adult. Member States should lay down practical arrangements regarding the presence of the child at their trial. These arrangements could include provisions concerning the conditions under which a child can be temporarily excluded from the trial.**
- (31) **Certain** rights provided for by this Directive should apply to children subject to European arrest warrant proceedings from the time they are arrested in the executing Member State.
- (31a) **The surrender procedure is crucial for cooperation in criminal matters between the Member States. Observance of the time-limits contained in Framework Decision 2002/584/JHA is essential for such cooperation. Therefore, while requested children should be able to fully exercise their rights under this Directive in European arrest warrant proceedings, those time-limits should be respected.**
- (31b) **Member States should take appropriate measures to ensure that judges and prosecutors who deal with criminal proceedings involving children have specific competence in that field and/or have effective access to specific training, in particular with regard to children's legal rights, appropriate interviewing techniques, child psychology, and communication in a language adapted to the child. Member States should also take appropriate measures to promote the provision of such specific training to lawyers who deal with criminal proceedings involving children.**
- (32) (deleted)

- (33) In order to monitor and evaluate the effectiveness of this Directive, there is a need for collection of **data** (...) with regard to the implementation of the rights set out in this Directive. **Such** (...) data include data recorded by the judicial authorities and by law enforcement authorities and, as far as possible, administrative data compiled by healthcare and social welfare services as regards the rights set out in this Directive, in particular in relation to the number of children given access to a lawyer, the number of individual assessments carried out, the number of interviews audio-visually recorded and the number of children deprived of liberty.
- (33a) Member States should respect and guarantee the rights set out in this Directive, without discrimination of any kind **based on any ground such as** race, colour, sex, sexual orientation, language, religion, political or other opinion, nationality, ethnic or social origin, property, disability **or** birth (...).
- (34) This Directive upholds the fundamental rights and principles as recognised by the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union and the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, including the prohibition of torture and inhuman and degrading treatment, the right to liberty and security, respect for private and family life, the right to the integrity of the person, the rights of the child, integration of persons with disabilities, the right to an effective remedy and to a fair trial, the presumption of innocence and the rights of defence. This Directive should be implemented in accordance with those rights and principles.
- (35) This Directive sets minimum rules. Member States may extend the rights set out in this Directive in order to provide a higher level of protection. Such higher level of protection should not constitute an obstacle to the mutual recognition of judicial decisions that those minimum rules are designed to facilitate. The level of protection should never fall below the standards provided by the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union or the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, as interpreted in the case law of the Court of Justice of the European Union and the European Court of Human Rights.

- (36) Since the objectives of this Directive, namely setting common minimum standards on procedural safeguards for children suspected or accused in criminal proceedings, cannot be sufficiently achieved by the Member States, but can rather, by reason of the scale of the measure, be better achieved at Union level, the Union may adopt measures in accordance with the principle of subsidiarity as set out in Article 5 of the Treaty on the European Union. In accordance with the principle of proportionality as set out in that Article, this Directive does not go beyond what is necessary in order to achieve these objectives.
- (37) In accordance with Articles 1 and 2 of Protocol 21 on the position of the United Kingdom and Ireland in respect of the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice, annexed to the Treaty on European Union and to the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union, and without prejudice to Article 4 of that Protocol, those Member States are not taking part in the adoption of this Directive and are not bound by it or subject to its application.
- (38) In accordance with Articles 1 and 2 of Protocol No 22 on the position of Denmark, annexed to the Treaty on the European Union and to the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union, Denmark is not taking part in the adoption of this Directive, and is not bound by it or subject to its application.
- (39) In accordance with the Joint Political Declaration of Member States and the Commission of 28 September 2011 on explanatory documents⁹, Member States have undertaken to accompany, in justified cases, the notification of their transposition measures with one or more documents explaining the relationship between the components of a directive and the corresponding parts of national transposition instruments. With regard to this Directive, the legislator considers the transmission of such documents to be justified,

⁹ OJ C 369, 17.12.2011, p. 14.

Article 1
Subject matter
[Agreement]

This Directive lays down minimum rules concerning certain rights of suspects or accused persons in criminal proceedings who are children and of children subject to a surrender procedure pursuant to Council Framework Decision 2002/584/JHA ("European arrest warrant proceedings").

Article 2
Scope

[Agreement on first sentence of paragraph 1, on paragraph 2 (subject to agreement on Article 17) and on paragraphs 4 and 5]

1. This Directive applies to children **who are suspected or accused in criminal proceedings. It applies until the [...] final determination of the question whether the suspect or accused person has committed the offence, including, where applicable, sentencing and the resolution of any appeal.**
2. This Directive applies to children subject to European arrest warrant proceedings **(requested persons)** from the time of their arrest in the executing Member State **in accordance with Article 17.**

3. **With the exception of Articles 5, 8(2)(b) and 15, referring to a holder of parental responsibility, this Directive, or certain provisions thereof, applies to suspects or accused persons subject to criminal proceedings referred to in paragraph 1, and to persons subject to European arrest warrant proceedings referred to in paragraph 2, where these persons were children when they became subject to the proceedings, but subsequently have become of age, and the application of the Directive, or certain provisions thereof, is appropriate in the light of all the circumstances of the case, including the maturity and vulnerability of the person concerned. Member States may decide that this Directive shall not anymore apply when the person concerned has reached the age of 21.**
4. This Directive also applies to children other than suspected or accused who, in the course of questioning by the police or by another law enforcement authority, become suspects or accused persons.
5. This Directive does not affect national rules determining the age of criminal responsibility.
- 5a. **Without prejudice to the right to a fair trial, in respect of minor offences:**
- (a) **where the law of a Member State provides for the imposition of a sanction by an authority other than a court having jurisdiction in criminal matters, and the imposition of such a sanction may be appealed or referred to such a court;**
or
 - (b) **where deprivation of liberty cannot be imposed as a sanction,**

this Directive shall only apply to the proceedings before a court having jurisdiction in criminal matters.

In any event, this Directive shall fully apply where the child is deprived of liberty, irrespective of the stage of the criminal proceedings.

6. [deleted]¹⁰

Article 3

Definitions

[Agreement]

For the purposes of this Directive the following definitions apply:

- **"child" means a person below the age of 18 years. Where it is uncertain whether the person has the age of 18 years, that person is presumed to be a child;**¹¹
- **"holder of parental responsibility" means any person having parental responsibility over a child;**
- **"parental responsibility" means all rights and duties relating to the person or the property of a child which are given to a natural or legal person by judgment, by operation of law or by an agreement having legal effect. The term includes rights of custody and rights of access.**

¹⁰ This paragraph has been replaced by revised recital 11d.

¹¹ See recital 11.

Article 4

Right to information

[Agreement, but text needs to be verified on consistency]

1. Member States shall ensure that **when children are made aware that they are suspected or accused of having committed a criminal offence, they shall be** informed promptly about their rights in accordance with Directive 2012/13/EU **and about general aspects of the conduct of the proceedings.**¹² In addition, Member States shall ensure that children are informed **about the rights set out in this Directive. The latter information shall be provided as follows:**
 - (a) **promptly when children are made aware that they are suspected or accused of having committed a criminal offence, in respect of:**
 - (i) **the right to have the holder of parental responsibility informed, as provided for in Article 5;**
 - (ii) **the right to be assisted by a lawyer as provided for in Article 6;**
 - (iii) **the right to protection of privacy, as provided for in Article 14;**
 - (iv) **the right to be accompanied by the holder of parental responsibility during certain stage(s) of the proceedings other than court hearings, in accordance with Article 15(4);**
 - (v) **the right to legal aid, as provided for in Article 18.**

¹² See accompanying recital 12a.

- (b) **at the earliest appropriate stage in the proceedings, in respect of:**
- (i) **the right to an individual assessment, as provided for in Article 7;**
 - (ii) **the right to a medical examination, including the right to medical assistance, as provided for in Article 8;¹³**
 - (iii) **the right to limitation of deprivation of liberty, including the right to periodic review of detention, as provided for in Article 10;**
 - (iv) **the right to alternative measures, as provided for in Article 11;**
 - (v) **the right to be accompanied by the holder of parental responsibility during court hearings, as provided for in Article 15(1);**
 - (vi) **the right to appear in person at trial, as provided for in Article 16;**
 - (vii) **the right to effective remedies, as provided for in Article 18a;**
- (c) **upon [deprivation of liberty/detention] in respect of:**
- (i) **the right to specific treatment during deprivation of liberty, as provided for in Article 12.**
 - ~~(ii) **the right to meet the holder of parental responsibility, as provided for in Article [12/12a/15].**~~

- 1a. **Member States shall ensure that the information referred to in paragraph 1 is given in writing and/or orally, in simple and accessible language, and that the information given is noted, using the recording procedure in accordance with national law.**
2. **Member States shall ensure that, where children are provided with a Letter of Rights pursuant to Directive 2012/13/EU, such Letter includes their rights under this Directive.**

¹³ See accompanying recital 12b.

Article 5

Right of the child to have the holder of parental responsibility informed

[Agreement]

1. Member States shall ensure that **the** holder of parental responsibility is provided **as soon as possible** with the information that the child receives in accordance with Article 4.¹⁴
2. **Where providing the information referred to in paragraph 1 to the holder of parental responsibility**
 - (a) **would be contrary to the best interests of the child;**
 - (b) **is not possible because, after reasonable efforts have been made, no holder of parental responsibility can be reached or his/her identity is unknown,**
 - (c) **could, on the basis of objective and factual circumstances, substantially jeopardise the criminal proceedings,**

the information shall be provided to another appropriate adult, nominated by the child and accepted as such by the competent authority. However, if the child has not nominated another appropriate adult, or the adult that has been nominated by the child is not acceptable to the competent authority, the competent authority shall, taking into account the best interests of the child, designate and provide the information to another person, who can also be a representative of an authority or other institution responsible for the protection or welfare of children.

3. **When the circumstances, which had led to an application of paragraph 2 under a), b) or c), have ceased to exist, any information that the child receives in accordance with Article 4, and which is still relevant in the course of the proceedings, shall be provided to the holder of parental responsibility.**¹⁵

¹⁴ See accompanying recitals 15 and 15a.

¹⁵ See accompanying recital 15b.

Article 6
Assistance by a lawyer ¹⁶

1. Children who are suspected or accused of having committed a criminal offence have the right of access to a lawyer in accordance with Directive 2013/48/EU. Nothing in this Directive, in particular in this Article, shall affect this right. ¹⁷

1a. Member States shall ensure that children are assisted by a lawyer in accordance with this Article so as to allow them to exercise their rights of defence effectively.

2. Member States shall ensure that children are assisted by a lawyer without undue delay once they are made aware that they are suspected or accused of having committed a criminal offence. In any event, children shall be assisted by a lawyer from whichever of the following points in time is the earliest:

- (a)** before they are questioned by the police or by another law enforcement or judicial authority;
- (b)** upon the carrying out by investigating or other competent authorities of an investigative or other evidence-gathering act in accordance with point (c) of paragraph 3;
- (c)** without undue delay after deprivation of liberty;
- (d)** where they have been summoned to appear before a court having jurisdiction in criminal matters, in due time before they appear before that court.

¹⁶ See accompanying recital 16.

¹⁷ See accompanying recital 16.

3. Assistance by a lawyer shall include the following: ¹⁸

- (a) Member States shall ensure that children have the right to meet in private and communicate with the lawyer representing them, including prior to questioning by the police or by another law enforcement or judicial authority;**
- (b) Member States shall ensure that children are assisted by a lawyer when they are questioned, and that the lawyer can participate effectively during questioning. Such participation shall be in accordance with procedures under national law, provided that such procedures do not prejudice the effective exercise and essence of the right concerned. Where a lawyer participates during questioning, the fact that such participation has taken place shall be noted using the recording procedure under national law;**
- (c) Member States shall ensure that children, as a minimum, are assisted by a lawyer during the following investigative or evidence-gathering acts, where those acts are provided for under national law and if the suspect or accused person is required or permitted to attend the act concerned:**
 - (i) identity parades;**
 - (ii) confrontations;**
 - (iii) reconstructions of the scene of a crime.**

4. Member States shall respect the confidentiality of communication between children and their lawyer in the exercise of the right to be assisted by a lawyer provided for under this Directive. Such communication shall include meetings, correspondence, telephone conversations and other forms of communication permitted under national law. ¹⁹

¹⁸ See accompanying recital 16a.

¹⁹ See recitals 17c and 17d.

4a. (deleted)²⁰

5. **Provided this is in conformity with the right to a fair trial and with the minimum rights set out in Directive 2013/48/EU, Member States may derogate from the obligations set out in paragraph 2 when [mandatory] assistance by a lawyer is not appropriate in the light of the circumstances of the case, including the seriousness and the complexity of the case and the measures that could be taken in respect of the alleged offence, it being understood that the best interests of the child shall always be a primary consideration.**

In any event, Member States shall ensure that children are assisted by a lawyer

(a) when they are brought before a competent court or judge in order to decide on detention at any stage of the proceedings within the scope of this Directive; and

(b) during detention.

Member States shall also ensure that [a custodial sentence is not imposed] [deprivation of liberty is not imposed as a criminal sentence], unless the child has been assisted by a lawyer. Member States shall take practical arrangements in this respect.²¹

7. Where the child has to be assisted by a lawyer in accordance with this Article but no lawyer is present, the competent authorities shall postpone the questioning of the child, **or other investigative or evidence gathering acts provided for in paragraph 3(c)**, for a reasonable period of time, so that they can await the arrival of the lawyer when the child has arranged a lawyer himself, or can arrange a lawyer for the child when this has not yet been done.

²⁰ Replaced by recital 16b.

²¹ See accompanying recital 17.

8.²² In exceptional circumstances and only at the pre-trial stage, Member States may temporarily derogate from the application of the rights provided for in paragraph 2 to the extent justified in the light of the particular circumstances of the case, on the basis of one of the following compelling reasons:

- (a) where there is an urgent need to avert serious adverse consequences for the life, liberty or physical integrity of a person;
- (b) where immediate action by the investigating authorities is imperative to prevent substantial jeopardy to criminal proceedings in relation to an offence as referred to in Article 2(2) of Framework Decision 2002/584/JHA.²³

Member States shall ensure that the competent authorities, when applying this paragraph, shall take the best interests of the child into account.

A decision to proceed to questioning in the absence of the lawyer under this paragraph may be taken only on a case-by-case basis, either by a judicial authority, or by another competent authority on condition that the decision can be submitted to judicial review.

9. (Moved to paragraph 5)

²² EP is checking the advisability of this paragraph with their Legal Service. See accompanying recitals 17a and 17b.

²³ Framework Decision 2002/584/JHA of 13 June 2002 on the European arrest warrant and the surrender procedures between Member States (OJ L 190, 18.07.2002, p. 1).

Article 7
Right to an individual assessment
[Agreement]

1. Member States shall ensure that the specific needs of children concerning protection, education, training and social integration are taken into account.
2. For that purpose children shall be individually assessed. The assessment shall in particular take into account the personality and maturity of the child, their **economic**, social and **family** background, **as well as any specific vulnerabilities of the child.** ²⁴
- 2a. The extent and detail of the individual assessment may vary depending on the circumstances of the case, the **measures that can be taken** if the child is found guilty of the alleged offence, **and** whether or not the child has **in the recent past been the subject of an individual assessment.** ²⁵
3. [placed after paragraph 4]
4. **The individual assessment shall serve to establish and to note, in accordance with the recording procedure in the Member State concerned, such information about the individual characteristics and circumstances of the child as might be of use by the competent authorities when**
 - a) **determining whether any specific measure benefitting the child is to be taken;**
 - b) **assessing the appropriateness and effectiveness of any precautionary measures in respect of the child;**
 - c) **taking any decision or course of action in the criminal proceedings, including when sentencing.** ²⁶

²⁴ See accompanying recital 19a.

²⁵ See accompanying recital 19b.

²⁶ See accompanying recital 19c.

- 4a. **The individual assessment shall take place at the earliest appropriate stage of the proceedings and, subject to paragraph 4b, before indictment.**
- 4b. **In the absence of an individual assessment, an indictment may nevertheless be presented, provided this is in the best interests of the child and provided the individual assessment should in any event be available at the beginning of the trial-hearings before the court.**²⁷
5. Individual assessments shall be carried out with close involvement of the child. **They shall be carried out by qualified personnel, following, as far as possible, a multidisciplinary approach and involving, where appropriate, the holder of parental responsibility or another appropriate adult and/or specialist professional.**
6. If the elements that form the basis of the individual assessment change significantly, Member States shall ensure that the individual assessment is updated throughout the criminal proceedings.
7. Member States may derogate from the obligation to carry out an individual assessment, **if the derogation is warranted by the circumstances of the case, and provided the best interests of the child are taken into account.**²⁸

²⁷ See accompanying recital 19d.

²⁸ See accompanying recital 19e.

Article 8
Right to a medical examination
[Agreement]²⁹

1. Member States shall ensure that children **who are deprived of liberty** have the **right** to a medical examination **without undue delay** with a view, in particular, to assessing the general mental and physical condition of the child. **The medical examination shall be as non-invasive as possible and carried out by a physician or another qualified professional.**
- 1a. **The results of the medical examination shall be taken into account when determining the capacity of the child to face questioning, other investigative or evidence gathering acts or any measures taken or envisaged against the child.**
2. **The medical examination shall be carried out either on initiative of the competent authorities, in particular when specific health indications give reasons for such a examination, or in response to a request by any of the following persons:**
 - (a) the child,
 - (b) **the** holder of parental responsibility or another appropriate adult referred to in Article 5;
 - (c) the child's lawyer.
3. The conclusion of the medical examination shall be recorded in writing. **When required, medical assistance shall be provided.**
4. Member States shall ensure that the medical examination is repeated where the circumstances so require.

²⁹ See accompanying recital 20.

Article 9
*Audio-visual recording of questioning*³⁰

1. Member States shall ensure that questioning of children by police or other law enforcement authorities during the criminal proceedings is audio-visually recorded, unless this is not proportionate in the circumstances of the case, taking into account inter alia whether a lawyer is present or not, whether the child is deprived of liberty or not, and the best interests of the child.
2. Where questioning is not audio-visually recorded, the questioning shall be recorded in another appropriate manner, such as by making written minutes, which are duly verified.
3. This Article is without prejudice to the possibility to ask questions for the sole purpose of personal identification of the child without audio-visual recording.

³⁰ See also accompanying recital 21a.

Article 10
Limitation of deprivation of liberty (...)

1. Member States shall ensure that **deprivation of liberty of a child at any stage of the proceedings** shall be for the shortest appropriate period of time. Due account shall be taken of the age and individual situation of the child, **and of the particular circumstances of the case.**

2. **Member States shall ensure that in respect of children, deprivation of liberty, in particular detention, shall only be imposed as a measure of last resort and for the shortest appropriate period of time.** Member States shall ensure that any detention **is based on a reasoned decision** subject to judicial review. Such decision shall **also** be subject to periodic review, **at reasonable intervals of time**, by a court. The review **shall be carried out either *ex officio* by the court, or at the request of the child, of the child's lawyer, or of a judicial authority which is not a court.** Without prejudice to judicial independence, **Member States shall ensure that decisions to be taken in accordance with this provision are taken without undue delay.**³¹

Article 11
Alternative measures
[Agreement]

Member States shall ensure that, wherever possible, the competent authorities shall have recourse to alternative measures instead of detention.³²

³¹ See accompanying recital 25.

³² See accompanying recital 25a.

Article 12

Specific treatment in case of deprivation of liberty

1. Member States shall ensure that children who are detained are held separately from adults, unless it is considered in the child's best interest not to do so.
- 1a. **Member States shall also ensure that children who are kept in police-custody are held separately from adults, unless it is considered in the child's best interests not to do so, or unless in exceptional circumstances it is not possible in practice to do so, the child's best interests being taken into account.**
2. **Without prejudice to paragraph 1, when a detained child reaches the age of 18 years, Member States shall provide for the possibility to continue to hold that person separately from other detained adults where warranted, taking into account the individual circumstances of the person concerned, and taking into account the best interests of children who are detained with that person.**
3. **Without prejudice to paragraph 1, and taking into account paragraph 2, children may be detained with young adults, unless this is contrary to the best interests of the children.**

4. When children are in detention, Member States shall take (...) appropriate measures to:
- (a) ensure and preserve the health, physical and mental development of the child;
 - (b) ensure the right to education and training of the child, including those children with physical, sensory and learning disabilities;
 - (c) ensure effective and regular exercise of the right to family life;³³
 - (d) ensure access to programmes that foster the development of the child and his or her future integration into society; and
 - (e) ensure respect for the freedom of religion or belief of the child.³⁴

This provision shall apply, where appropriate, to other situations of deprivation of liberty.

The measures taken shall be proportionate and appropriate to the nature and duration of the deprivation of liberty.

5. Member States shall endeavour that children who are deprived of liberty can meet the holder of parental responsibility as soon as possible, where such meeting is compatible with investigative and operational requirements. This provision is without prejudice to the provisions of Article 5 relating to the designation of another appropriate adult.

³³ See new accompanying recital 26c.

³⁴ See accompanying recital 26d.

Article 13
Timely and diligent treatment of cases
[Agreement]

1. Member States shall **take all appropriate measures to** ensure that criminal proceedings involving children are treated as a matter of urgency and with due diligence.

2. Member States shall **take appropriate measures to** ensure that children are **always treated in a manner which protects their dignity and which is** appropriate to their age, their special needs, their maturity and level of understanding, and bearing in mind any communication difficulties they may have.

Article 14
Right to protection of privacy
[Agreement]

1. **Member States shall ensure that the privacy of children during criminal proceedings is protected.** ³⁵
2. **To that end, Member States shall either provide that court hearings involving children are ordinarily held in the absence of the public, or allow courts or judges to decide to hold such hearings in the absence of the public.**
3. **Member States shall take appropriate measures to ensure that the records referred to in Article 9 are not publicly disseminated.**
4. **Member States shall, with respect for freedom of expression and information and freedom and pluralism of the media, encourage the media to take self-regulatory measures in order to reach the objectives set out in this Article.**

³⁵ See accompanying recital 28.

Article 15

Right of the child to be accompanied by the holder of parental responsibility during the proceedings

[Agreement]

1. Member States shall ensure that children have the right to be accompanied by the holder of parental responsibility during court hearings in which they are involved.³⁶
2. In the situations where the presence of the holder of parental responsibility accompanying the child during court hearings
 - (a) would be contrary to the best interests of the child;
 - (b) is not possible because, after reasonable efforts have been made, no holder of parental responsibility can be reached or his/her identity is unknown; or
 - (c) would, on the basis of objective and factual circumstances, substantially jeopardise the criminal proceedings,³⁷

the child has the right to be accompanied by another appropriate adult, who may be nominated by the child and accepted as such by the competent authority. However, if the child has not nominated another appropriate adult, or the adult that has been nominated by the child is not acceptable to the competent authority, the competent authority shall, taking into account the best interests of the child, designate and provide the information to another person, who can also be a representative of an authority or other institution responsible for the protection or welfare of children.

³⁶ See accompanying recital 29.

³⁷ See accompanying recital 29a.

- 3. When the circumstances, which had led to an application of paragraph 2 under a), b) or c), have ceased to exist, the child has the right to be accompanied by the holder of parental responsibility during any remaining court hearings.**
- 4. In addition to the right provided under paragraph 1, Member States shall ensure that children also have the right to be accompanied by the holder of parental responsibility, or by another appropriate adult as referred to in paragraph 2, during stages of the proceedings, other than court hearings, at which the child is present, where the competent authority considers that**
- (a) it is in the interest of the child to be accompanied by this person; and**
 - (b) the presence of this person will not prejudice the criminal proceedings.³⁸**

³⁸ See accompanying recital 29b.

Article 16

Right of children to appear in person at, and participate in, their trial

[Agreement]

1. Member States shall ensure that children **have the right to be present at their trial and shall take all necessary measures to enable them to participate effectively in the trial, including by giving them the opportunity to be heard and to express their views.**
2. **Member States shall ensure that children, who were not present at their trial, have the right to a new trial, or another legal remedy, in accordance with and under the conditions set out in Directive 2016/XX/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council on the strengthening of certain aspects of the presumption of innocence and of the right to be present at trial in criminal proceedings.**

Article 17

European Arrest Warrant proceedings

Member States shall ensure that the rights referred to in Articles 4, 5, 6, 8, [10,] [11,] [12,] 13, 14, [15] and [18] shall apply *mutatis mutandis* in respect of a requested child upon his arrest pursuant to European arrest warrant proceedings in the executing Member State.³⁹

³⁹ This provision has not yet been discussed by Council.

Article 18

Right to legal aid

Member States shall ensure that national law in relation to legal aid guarantees the effective exercise of the right to be assisted by a lawyer as referred to in Article 6.

Article 18a

Remedies

Member States shall ensure that suspected or accused children in criminal proceedings, as well as children subject to European arrest warrant proceedings, have an effective remedy under national law in the event of a breach of their rights under this Directive.

Article 19
Training
[Agreement]

1. Member States shall ensure that law enforcement authorities and staff **of detention facilities** who deal with cases involving children receive **specific training to a level appropriate to their contact with children** with regard to children's legal rights, appropriate interviewing techniques, child psychology, **and** communication in a language adapted to the child.
 - 1a. Without prejudice to judicial independence and differences in the organisation of the judiciary **in the Member States, and with due respect for the role of those responsible for the training of judges and prosecutors**, Member States **shall take appropriate measures to ensure** that judges and prosecutors **who deal with criminal proceedings involving children have specific competence in that field and/or have effective access to specific training.** ⁴⁰
2. With **due respect for the independence of the legal profession and for the role of those responsible for the training of lawyers**, Member States shall take appropriate measures to promote the provision of such specific training to lawyers who deal with **criminal proceedings involving children.**
3. Through their public services or by funding child support organisations, Member States shall encourage initiatives enabling those providing children with support and restorative justice services to receive adequate training to a level appropriate to their contact with children and observe professional standards to ensure such services are provided in an impartial, respectful and professional manner.

⁴⁰ See accompanying recital 31b.

(ex Article 19a as proposed by EP)

Non discrimination

[Transferred to recital 33a]

Article 20 ⁴¹

Data collection

Member States shall by [*three years after the date mentioned in Article 23.1*] and every three years thereafter, send to the Commission **available** data showing how the rights set out in this Directive have been implemented.

Article 21

Costs

Member States shall meet the costs resulting from the application of Articles 7, 8 and 9 irrespective of the outcome of the proceedings, unless, as regards the costs resulting from the application of Article 8, they are covered [...] through a medical insurance.

⁴¹ See also recital 33.

Article 22

Non-regression clause

Nothing in this Directive shall be construed as limiting or derogating from any of the rights and procedural safeguards that are ensured under the Charter, the ECHR, or other relevant provisions of international law, in particular the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, or the law of any Member State which provides a higher level of protection.

Article 23

Transposition

1. Member States shall bring into force the laws, regulations and administrative provisions necessary to comply with this Directive by [36 months after its publication]. They shall immediately inform the Commission thereof
2. When Member States adopt these measures, they shall contain a reference to this Directive or shall be accompanied by such a reference on the occasion of their official publication. The methods of making such a reference shall be laid down by the Member States.
3. Member States shall communicate to the Commission the text of the measures of national law which they adopt in the field covered by this Directive.

Article 23a

Report

The Commission shall, by [three years after the end of the transposition deadline] submit a report to the European Parliament and to the Council, assessing the extent to which the Member States have taken the necessary measures to comply with this Directive, including an evaluation of the application of Article 6, accompanied, if necessary, by legislative proposals.

Article 24

Entry into force

This Directive shall enter into force on the twentieth day following that of its publication in the *Official Journal of the European Union*.

Article 25

Addressees

This Directive is addressed to the Member States in accordance with the Treaties.

Done at [Brussels],

For the European Parliament

The President

For the Council

The President
