

European Commission
against Racism and Intolerance

ECRI
Commission européenne
contre le racisme et l'intolérance

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

CRI(2019)29

ANNUAL REPORT ON ECRI'S ACTIVITIES

covering the period
from 1 January to 31 December 2018

Visit our website:
www.coe.int/ecri

ECRI Secretariat
Directorate General II - Democracy
Council of Europe
F-67075 Strasbourg Cedex
Tel.: +33 (0)3 90 21 46 62

Strasbourg, June 2019

Preface-----	5
Main trends -----	7
ECRI's activities in 2018-----	17
1. Country-by-country approach -----	17
2. Work on general themes-----	19
3. Relations with civil society-----	19
4. Cooperation with Equality Bodies to combat racism and racial discrimination -----	20
5. Other activities-----	21
6. Communication strategy -----	22
Co-operation with relevant bodies of the Council of Europe and other international organisations -----	23
Appendix I – Membership of ECRI -----	29
Appendix II – Secretariat of ECRI-----	37
Appendix III - Meetings held by ECRI in 2018-----	39
Appendix IV - List of publications -----	41

Preface

The European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) is a mechanism which was established by the first Summit of Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe member states. The decision to establish ECRI is contained in the Vienna Declaration adopted by the first Summit on 9 October 1993. On 13 June 2002, the Committee of Ministers adopted an autonomous Statute for ECRI and thus consolidated its role as an independent human rights monitoring mechanism specialised in questions relating to racism and intolerance.

ECRI's task is to combat racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance at the level of greater Europe and from the perspective of the protection of human rights. ECRI's action covers all necessary measures to combat violence, discrimination and prejudice faced by persons or groups of persons, on grounds of "race", colour, language, religion, nationality, national or ethnic origin, sexual orientation and gender identity.

ECRI's members are appointed on the basis of their in-depth knowledge in the field of combating intolerance. They should have high moral authority and recognised expertise in dealing with racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance. They serve in their individual capacity, are independent and impartial in fulfilling their mandate, and do not receive any instructions from their government.

ECRI's statutory activities are: country monitoring; work on general themes; and relations with civil society and equality bodies. ECRI's strategy for constantly enhancing its activities is to take a step-by-step approach, building on the work it has already accomplished by evaluating, consolidating and extending its action.

Main trends

Introduction

1. Each year, as an introduction to its annual report, ECRI outlines the main trends in the fields of racism¹, racial discrimination², xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance in Europe. The purpose of this exercise is to show the context in which ECRI operates. The precise characteristics and extent of these trends, observed in the course of ECRI's various activities, differ from region to region and country to country. They are, however, sufficiently widespread to justify a special mention.

2. During 2018, ECRI completed the remaining country visits of its fifth monitoring cycle³ focusing on the following main topics: national legislation against racism and racial discrimination, racist and homo/transphobic hate speech and violence, and integration policies. In addition ECRI also covered a certain number of country specific topics, which included, inter alia, discrimination against LGBT persons.

3. ECRI encountered a diverse range of situations characterised on the one hand by a certain degree of progress and sometimes promising practices and on the other hand by persisting problems and even, on occasion, resistance to addressing the fundamental obstacles to achieving full equality. In order to strengthen the political commitments to overcoming these barriers and to galvanise support for ECRI to continue its efforts and step up its action in the future, it is planned to hold a conference marking ECRI's 25th anniversary under the French Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe in September 2019 bringing together representatives of member states and other stakeholders.

¹ According to ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No.7, racism is the belief that a ground such as "race", colour, language, religion, nationality or national or ethnic origin justifies contempt for a person or a group of persons, or the notion of superiority of a person or a group of persons.

² According to ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No.7, racial discrimination is any differential treatment based on a ground such as "race", colour, language, religion, nationality or national or ethnic origin, which has no objective and reasonable justification.

³ The remaining fifth cycle ECRI country reports will be published in 2019.

Migration and Xenophobia

4. Xenophobic populism continues to make its mark on the contemporary political climate in Europe. It fuels an anti-immigrant rhetoric, which often results in racist hate speech, breaking taboos and inciting further expressions of hatred. This banalisation stands in sharp contrast to previously existing norms of public discourse and is of serious concern. Verbal transgressions are now a frequent occurrence.

5. The agenda of populist politicians, who aim at dividing societies along national, ethnic or religious boundaries, remains a major concern. Ideologies based on an assumed incompatibility between national/ethnic or religious groups present a danger to inclusive societies, as do those that advocate “racial” superiority. Both nurture hatred and fear and pitch different groups against each other.

6. Xenophobic movements continue to fuel a discourse based on divisions along identity lines. The “us” and “them” ideology threatens inclusive societies and a tolerance-based principle that underpins Europe’s democratic societies. ECRI noticed such views not only among fringe politicians, but also increasingly within mainstream political parties and national governments. The divisive powers of this trend have also become visible, such as in the much polarised discussions about the Global Compact for Migration⁴, which several Council of Europe member states decided not to join. Europe is now facing growing opposition to the previously generally accepted principle of multi-culturalism as a positive and desirable aspect for our societies.

Hate Speech⁵

7. The growing public anxiety about economic, geopolitical and technological changes is exploited by scapegoating migrants and minorities, including Roma and Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Intersex (LGBTI) persons. In this scenario, political discourse

⁴ The Global Compact for Safe, Orderly and Regular Migration (GCM), which was adopted on 10 December 2018, is the first inter-governmentally negotiated legally non-binding document, prepared under the auspices of the United Nations, to cover all dimensions of international migration in a holistic and comprehensive manner.

⁵ For a definition of hate speech, please refer to ECRI’s GPR No. 15 on combating hate speech.

based on a divisive propaganda and a lack of prompt and clear counter-speech is recurrent in ECRI's findings.

8. Such hate speech is particularly prevalent on the internet and in social media, fed by so-called "opinion-bubbles" in which people communicate with others holding similar views. The need for stronger and more effective responses to online hatred is still tangible, including via better regulation and counter-speech. Furthermore, the situation concerning online hate speech is made worse by the increasing spread of so-called "fake news", which is often designed to produce distorted images of vulnerable minority groups.

9. There is a need for a lasting climate of tolerance and respect for diversity. Politicians and religious and community leaders need to play an active role in tackling hate speech. They should not only avoid using hate speech in public discourse, but they should also promptly, pro-actively and publicly counter it.

10. On the positive side, ECRI found that a growing number of countries have taken important steps to bring their legislation on combating hate speech in line with European and international standards. However, adopting laws is, on its own, not sufficient to build a lasting climate of tolerance and respect for diversity. Laws must also be applied and awareness about their existence promoted. Furthermore, openness and tolerance in society can only be genuine if they are not limited to certain predefined groups but include everyone. The fight against racism and intolerance, including hate speech, is not only of interest to vulnerable groups. All persons must be protected against discrimination, including those not belonging to minorities, in order to achieve full equality.

11. Hate speech is also potentially detrimental to the democratic order of member states because it is often the first step towards acts of racist or homo-/transphobic violence, which can put into question the social fabric as a whole. It is noteworthy in this context that in an increasing number of member states the authorities have introduced special focal points within the police tasked to liaise with vulnerable groups. This has in many cases led to a growing trust among members of minority groups in the law enforcement agencies. This in turn has increased the willingness of victims of hate crime, such as threats or violent attacks, to report such incidents to the police, thereby also tackling the problem of under-reporting of hate crime.

During 2018, ECRI encouraged member states to take up or continue this good practice.

Equality Bodies⁶

12. In 2017, ECRI adopted the revised version of its General Policy Recommendation (GPR) No. 2 on Equality Bodies to combat racism and intolerance at national level. In 2018, the guidance contained in this GPR was disseminated and its best possible application discussed with a multitude of stakeholders. Today almost all member states of the Council of Europe have Equality Bodies, many of which have been in existence for some time already. Their work has resulted in useful experiences with respect to improving access to justice and ensuring equality.

13. One of the most important requirements for Equality Bodies to be effective is their full independence from governments. Furthermore they must also be given adequate resources to be able to carry out their work successfully. While this is not yet fully the case in all member states, ECRI noted an increased awareness among political decision makers of the overall importance of having effective Equality Bodies in order to build inclusive societies. ECRI will pay particular attention to the situation of Equality Bodies in its sixth monitoring cycle, beginning in January 2019.

Islamophobia

14. Islamophobia is still prevalent in most member states. In public discourse, Islam and Muslims continue to be associated with radicalisation, violence and terrorism. There is, generally, only very little positive media coverage of Muslim communities in Europe. Islamophobic hatred is often spread via the Internet. Anti-Muslim sentiments are also regularly manifested in petitions and protest rallies against the construction of mosques. In many member states a dangerous “normalisation” of Islamophobic prejudice can be observed.

15. Multiple discrimination is often faced by Black Muslims. Muslim women wearing visible religious symbols are also particularly vulnerable to discrimination and violence due to the intersectionality of religion and gender. Muslim women are frequently the targets of

⁶ The term “national specialised bodies” was updated to “equality bodies” in the revised version of GPR No. 2 which was published on 27 February 2018.

violence which often involves pulling off face veils and headscarves or being spat at. ECRI always calls for strong actions to prevent and punish such attacks, since public humiliation of this kind undermines human dignity, creates fear and isolation as well as hindering integration.

Antisemitism

16. Jewish people in Europe continue to be confronted with antisemitic hatred, including violence. Extremist groups, especially Neo-Nazis and Islamists, pose particular threats to the safety of Jewish communities and their members across the continent. Jewish institutions, such as synagogues, community centres and cemeteries, are often vandalised, also in reaction to events in the Middle East. The view that attacks on Jewish persons and property could be considered as justifiable reactions to policies or actions of the Israeli government is, regrettably, widespread and not only held by members of extremist groups. Such condoning of antisemitic acts needs to be more strongly rejected, in particular by persons holding public office, in order to reassure the Jewish people in Europe that they are an integral part of the societies they live in and are protected by the law.

17. In order to combat antisemitism more effectively, a growing number of member states have adopted the IHRA (International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance) Working Definition of Antisemitism. Close cooperation between Jewish communities and national authorities has shown to be an effective tool to counter antisemitism in its various shapes and forms. Government support for inter-religious dialogue has also yielded some positive results.

Anti-Black racism

18. Members of Europe's Black communities continue to suffer from negative stereotypes, prejudice, hate speech, and also violence. Their social marginalisation is often exacerbated by discrimination in various fields of day-to-day life. ECRI has noted that their situation particularly in the areas of housing and employment is characterised by frequent anti-Black racism. In many countries, people of African descent are disproportionately often employed in low-skilled positions, even when they have obtained higher educational qualifications, including university degrees. Such structural problems only perpetuate their socio-economic exclusion and counteract the growing efforts of Black community organisations

to promote better integration, in particular for the younger generations.

19. With the growing anti-immigrant sentiments persons of African descent who were born in Europe, or have lived here for a long period of time already, and are citizens of a member state, also face increasing resentment. Black persons who are Muslims are often victims of multiple discrimination, in which Islamophobia is added to racism based on skin colour. It is furthermore of particular concern that Black people are often subject to racial profiling practices by law enforcement officials. Strong condemnation of such actions is needed, as they erode a sense of belonging and integration achievements made so far, as well as trust in the state.

Integration of Refugees and Beneficiaries of International/Humanitarian Protection

20. Many member states have adopted strategies and action plans for the integration of refugees and beneficiaries of international/humanitarian protection following the large number of new arrivals during the migration crisis⁷ of 2014 and 2015. ECRI is pleased to note that they are often very comprehensive and include various aspects of integration, such as language learning and introduction to national culture, education and employment training, housing and access to health. There is a growing awareness amongst many governments that successful integration requires continued and sustained long-term efforts and financial resources.

21. Efforts need to be strengthened especially in the area of employment. During its country visits, ECRI has frequently noticed that the labour-market participation rate following the completion of employment training courses for refugees and beneficiaries of international/humanitarian protection is generally still too low. This problem is particularly pronounced among women and member states need to address the specific socio-economic and cultural obstacles to their employment.

Roma and Travellers

22. Roma continue to be one of the most marginalized communities in Europe. Poverty, extremely low levels of education, very high unemployment rates and often desolate and insecure

⁷ As defined in ECRI's 2015 Annual Report.

housing conditions still affect the lives of many Roma. In many member states, enrolment rates of Roma children in pre-school education are still low. While several member states have seen some improvements with regard to primary school enrolment and attendance, the number of Roma children dropping out before finishing secondary school remains unacceptably high. Such a pronounced lack of formal education invariably leads to very elevated rates of unemployment. ECRI noticed that in many cases training programmes for the unemployed have minimum education requirements that Roma often do not meet. The absence of a sufficient regular income, in combination with widespread prejudice and discrimination against Roma, perpetuates the severe poverty of this vulnerable group.

23. ECRI observed some small progress, for example, through the increased training of Roma mediators and their outreach work in schools and healthcare services. The massive scale-up of Roma support activities, however, that would be needed to break the vicious cycle of poverty and social exclusion has not happened yet. Sufficient long-term funding for national Roma strategies and action plans is rarely forthcoming. The project-based approach towards Roma integration tends to lack continuity and reliability and the interruption of activities often endangers any small gains already made.

Historical Ethnic Minorities

24. In addition to Roma, ECRI also looks into the situation of other historical ethnic minorities/national minorities with regard to their integration. In this respect ECRI cooperates closely with the Council of Europe's Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (FCNM). As in previous years, ECRI noted that historical ethnic minorities are sometimes viewed primarily from a national security perspective. Such an approach has the potential to perpetuate negative stereotypes and hinder the integration of members of those minorities.

Homo- and Transphobia

25. While Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Intersex (LGBTI) persons enjoy protection of their human rights in many member states, in others they continue to face discrimination and violence in environments where homophobia and transphobia still

persist. In 2018, worrying incidents were reported in some countries, such as restrictions on freedom of expression and freedom of assembly of LGBTI persons, several homophobic statements made by public figures which promote stereotypes and prejudice against LGBTI persons and render them targets of violence, and physical attacks against LGBTI persons and on LGBTI -friendly venues. Homo- and transphobic hatred spread particularly through the Internet and in social media continued to fuel hostility towards these persons.

26. On the positive side, ECRI observed in several member states that the authorities made efforts to establish close cooperation with members of LGBTI communities, particularly with a view to advancing their human rights on the one hand, and to promoting tolerance on the other, notably through policies, strategies and action plans. In some countries, legislative and regulatory efforts were also made to grant further rights to same-sex couples, such as the right to enter into a civil partnership, the right to marry, the right to adopt children, and rights on social benefits, taxation, pensions and inheritance. These efforts continued to yield some promising results in increasing the visibility and positive perception of LGBTI persons among the public, which in turn can play a significant role in countering discrimination and hate-motivated incidents against these persons. ECRI called on member states to take strong measures against anti-LGBTI hate incidents.

Intersectionality

27. Intersectionality, and by extension intersectional discrimination, are important concepts in ECRI's work. They help to pinpoint intertwined forms of inequality and show how individuals can face multiple threats of discrimination when their identities consist of overlapping categories such as "race", ethnicity, gender, disability and other characteristics. For instance ECRI has highlighted that Roma girls and women are particularly vulnerable to inadequate access to education and health care due to the intersectionality of ethnicity, gender and poverty (social class).

Artificial Intelligence

28. During 2018, ECRI observed an unfolding discussion at many levels about potential links between Artificial Intelligence (AI) and racial discrimination. The use of AI is growing rapidly in our societies. It can have an enormous impact on our personal lives as

well as on society as a whole. While AI can offer opportunities for the benefit of people, the potential also to embed and perpetuate bias and discrimination, whether intentionally or unintentionally, constitutes a challenge and a concern, which is likely to grow with the increasing use of AI in the future. Managing the application of the component tools and algorithms of AI may fail to take into account cultural, societal, language or gender-based contexts and sensitivities, or the public interest. Some research also suggests that AI-based profiling and advertising systems have facilitated discrimination along racial and religious lines.

The European Convention on Human Rights

29. Protocol No. 12, which supplements the European Convention on Human Rights by prohibiting discrimination in general, has been ratified by 20 of the 47 member States of the Council of Europe, the most recent ratification being by Portugal in 2017.

30. ECRI is pleased to note that its standards and country findings continue to be referred to by the European Court of Human Rights in its judgments. In 2018 the Court cited ECRI's work in the following judgments: *GRA Stiftung gegen Rassismus und Antisemitismus v. Switzerland*, (Application no. 18597/13), 9 January 2018; *Mariya Alekhina and others v. Russia*, (Application no. 38004/12), 17 July 2018; *Savva Terentyev v. Russia*, (Application no. 10692/09), 28 August 2018; *Burlya and others v. Ukraine*, (Application no. 3289/10), 6 November 2018; *Lakatošová and Lakatoš v. Slovakia*, (Application no. 655/16), 11 December 2018.

ECRI's activities in 2018

1. Country-by-country approach

31. ECRI's statutory activities comprise firstly country monitoring work. ECRI closely examines the situation in each of the member States of the Council of Europe and draws up suggestions and proposals as to how the problems it has identified might be overcome. The aim is to formulate helpful and well-founded recommendations, which may assist governments in taking concrete and practical steps to counter racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance.

32. ECRI's reports are first sent in draft form to the member States concerned for confidential dialogue. Their contents are reviewed in light of the national authorities' comments. They are then finally adopted and transmitted to the governments of the member States concerned, through the intermediary of the Council of Europe's Committee of Ministers.

33. ECRI's country-by-country approach concerns all Council of Europe member States on an equal footing. The reports for the first round were completed in late 1998. From January 1999 to the end of December 2002, ECRI worked on the second round of its country-by-country approach. From January 2003 to the end of December 2007, ECRI worked on the third round of its country-by-country approach. From January 2008 until September 2017, ECRI worked on its fourth round of country monitoring. This round differed from the previous ones in that it introduced the interim follow-up mechanism: ECRI requested priority implementation for up to three recommendations and asked the member State concerned to provide information in this connection within two years from the publication of the report.

34. ECRI began its fifth round of country monitoring in 2013. This focuses on certain topics for in-depth analysis in all member States: legislative issues, hate speech, racist and homo/transphobic violence and integration policies. In addition, each report deals with a certain number of topics specific to each country. These address any other major "racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia, antisemitism or intolerance" issues in the country concerned. Interim recommendations not implemented or only partially implemented

during the fourth cycle are followed-up as well. Finally, under its mandate to monitor intolerance against vulnerable groups, ECRI addresses discrimination against LGBTI communities in the section on country-specific issues. In 2018, ECRI published conclusions on the implementation of the priority recommendations it had made in its fifth round reports, published in 2015, namely on Albania, Austria, the Czech Republic, Estonia, Greece, Hungary, Norway and Poland.

35. In order to obtain as full a picture as possible, a contact visit is organised before the drafting of each new report. The visits provide an opportunity for ECRI Rapporteurs to meet officials from the various ministries and public authorities dealing with issues within ECRI's remit. They also allow Rapporteurs to meet representatives of NGOs working in the field, as well as independent experts and other persons concerned by the fight against racism and intolerance.

36. In 2018, ECRI published eight fifth-round country monitoring reports on Croatia, Liechtenstein, Malta, the Republic of Moldova, Portugal, San Marino, Spain and Sweden.

37. All reports published in 2018 have been translated into the national language(s) of the country concerned and steps have been taken to ensure that they are circulated as widely as possible among stakeholders at domestic level.

38. ECRI's reports received considerable media coverage. Reactions to these reports show how topical the issues discussed therein are and how urgent it is to ensure follow-up to their recommendations.

39. In 2018 ECRI carried out six contact visits in Finland, Ireland, the Netherlands, Romania, the Russian Federation and Slovenia.

40. In 2018, ECRI continued work to prepare its sixth cycle of country monitoring, which will start in 2019. ECRI's sixth cycle will focus on three main themes: effective equality and access to rights; hate speech and hate-motivated violence; and integration and inclusion. The reports will also deal with topics specific to each country, including follow-up of the interim recommendations adopted in the fifth monitoring cycle.

41. To be able to maintain this rhythm of visits and the quality of the work that is expected of it under its Statute, ECRI needs a Secretariat with sufficient resources and expertise.

2. Work on general themes

General Policy Recommendations

42. ECRI's General Policy Recommendations, the second part of its statutory activities, are addressed to the governments of all member States; they cover important areas of current concern in the fight against racism and intolerance. They are intended to serve as guidelines for policy-makers when drawing up national strategies, programmes and projects.

43. On 27 February 2018, ECRI published the revised General Policy Recommendation (GPR) No. 2 on Equality Bodies⁸ to combat racism and intolerance at national level. This new version of GPR No. 2 on Equality Bodies draws on best practices and contains standards to help member states to further strengthen their equality bodies, which are vital for advancing equality and for eliminating racism and violence in a sustained manner. While focusing on the key elements for their establishment, independence and effective functioning, the revised GPR No. 2 emphasises the importance of ensuring equality bodies fully execute their two essential functions: to promote equality and prevent discrimination and to support people exposed to discrimination and intolerance and to pursue litigation on their behalf.

44. During the year, ECRI completed the publication in the Council of Europe's official languages of its set of abridged versions of ECRI GPRs, adding the abridged versions of GPRs Nos. 2 (revised), 3, 12, 13 and 14 to its existing collection (GPRs Nos. 5, 9, 10, 11, 15 and 16). These versions contain the key points and are presented in an attractive format, for use by the general public. They were widely distributed for use at both internal and external events and were translated into other European languages for specific events.

3. Relations with civil society

45. Combating racism and intolerance can only be effective if the message filters down to society in general. Awareness-raising and a communication strategy are, therefore, essential. ECRI attaches great importance to this third part of its statutory activities.

⁸ The term "national specialised bodies" was updated with "equality bodies" in the revised version of GPR No. 2 which was published on 27 February 2018.

46. In 2018, ECRI participated in events organised by several civil society organisations on various themes. On 7 September, ECRI participated in a round table workshop entitled “Partnerships for Practice: Making the Global Compact for Migration Work”, organised by the Global Compacts Research Group at the Queen Mary University of London (QMUL). ECRI also took part in a conference on hate crime organised by the Institute of Democracy and Civil Society in Jena (Germany).

Organisation of national round tables in member states.

47. As an important tool to facilitate dialogue between state and non-state actors on issues related to the fight against racism and intolerance, ECRI organises national round tables following the publication of its country-specific monitoring reports. These events are addressed to various actors in civil society as well as to government officials in order to discuss jointly how best to promote the implementation of ECRI’s recommendations.

48. ECRI organised a round table in Yerevan on 25 June 2018, in co-operation with the Human Rights Defender and the Ministry of Justice of Armenia. This event brought together national and local authorities, academics, representatives of the judiciary and law enforcement, international organisations and NGOs, as well as members of vulnerable groups of concern to ECRI. Participants discussed the follow-up to the recommendations of ECRI’s 2016 report on Armenia, in particular the legislative and institutional framework for combating discrimination and integration policies, refugees and other migrants.

49. This round table brought more visibility to ECRI’s work and ensured greater impact for its recommendations in Armenia.

4. Cooperation with Equality Bodies to combat racism and racial discrimination

50. Equality Bodies are strategic partners for ECRI. ECRI held its annual seminar with Equality Bodies on 24 May 2018 in Strasbourg. The morning session was dedicated to the launching of the revised General Policy Recommendation (GPR) No. 2 on Equality Bodies and aimed to support the implementation of more robust standards for equality bodies in the member states. In addition to the representatives of member States’ equality bodies, including national Ombudspersons and national human rights

institutions; members of ECRI; European and international intergovernmental organisations, NGOs and networks, the event was attended by representatives of national authorities and members of national parliaments. The afternoon session discussed equality bodies' role in combating the use of hate speech, highlighting achievements as well as areas requiring improvement.

51. ECRI took part in the 4th IPCAN (Independent Police Complaints Authorities' Network) Seminar on "Police conduct of law enforcement services in their relationships with migrants in Europe", hosted by the French Defender of Rights on 14 December 2018 in Paris. ECRI also continued its co-operation with the European network of equality bodies (Equinet), including by participating in an Equinet conference on 'Investing in Equality' held in Brussels on 1 June 2018 and an Equinet Seminar on Equality bodies tackling hate speech held from 19-21 November 2018 in Rome.

5. Other activities

52. In 2018, ECRI actively participated in events organised by national and local authorities. On 2-3 February, ECRI's Chair and first Vice-Chair took part in a training programme for teachers on ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No. 10 on combating racism and racial discrimination in and through school education. This training took place in Athens, at the request of the Mayor of Athens and in co-operation with the Office of the SG's Special Representative on migration and refugees. On 22-23 May in Sofia, ECRI's Chair participated in a Training Seminar for Policy Makers and Young Diplomats on Human Rights and the Fight against Antisemitism and Hate Crime, co-organised by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Bulgaria, Yad Vashem and the EU Agency on Fundamental Rights (FRA). ECRI's first Vice-Chair took part in a Conference on Human Rights and Equality 2.0, organised by the Ministry for European Affairs and Equality of Malta in Valletta on 24 May. The ECRI member in respect of Romania presented ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No. 12 on combating racism and racial discrimination in the field of sport and examples of good practice at a Conference on Instruments on Combating Racism and Racial Discrimination and Equality in Sport, which took place in Bucharest on 9 November, co-organised by the Society of Legal Sciences, the Bucharest Bar, the National Council for Combating Discrimination and the Parliament of Romania. It was attended by the Romanian Ministry of Sport and Youth, the National

Council for Combating Discrimination, international organisations such as the Olympic Committee, FIFA, UEFA, various athletes and representatives of sports associations; representatives of local authorities and NGOs.

53. At its 77th plenary meeting on 4-7 December, ECRI held elections to the posts of two Vice-Chairs and one Bureau member. Ms Maria Daniella Marouda (member in respect of Greece) was elected 1st Vice-Chair until 31 December 2019 and Ms Domenica Ghidei Biidu (member in respect of the Netherlands) was elected 2nd Vice-Chair for one year. Mr Cristian Jura (member in respect of Romania) was elected Bureau member for two years. All the above elections were held in accordance with Articles 6 and 7 of ECRI's Internal Rules of Procedure.

6. Communication strategy

54. In order to reach out to a wider public, ECRI completed the publication and translation into non-official languages of all abridged versions of its general policy recommendations, which were distributed in September 2018 to national authorities, Council of Europe Co-operation Offices, Equality Bodies, NGOs and networks of professional groups. All of the abridged versions have been translated into various non-official languages of the Council of Europe, such as German, Russian, Turkish, Finnish, Polish and Slovak. Furthermore, activities such as the publication of ECRI's country reports and interim follow-up conclusions, country visits, the launching of its General Policy Recommendation No. 2 (revised) on Equality Bodies and its round table in Armenia attracted considerable media attention. Approximately 400 press articles covering ECRI's work were identified over the year. ECRI will continue to take further steps to strengthen its communication strategy.

Co-operation with relevant bodies of the Council of Europe and other international organisations

55. ECRI participated in and contributed to many events as part of its co-operation with relevant bodies of the Council of Europe and other international organisations.

Council of Europe

56. During its 75th plenary meeting (21-23 March 2018), ECRI held an exchange of views with Mr Thorbjørn Jagland, Secretary General of the Council of Europe. During its 76th plenary meeting (19-22 June 2018), ECRI held an exchange of views with Mr Tomáš Boček, Special Representative of the Secretary General on Migration and Refugees on the protection of migrants and refugees in member States. It also held an exchange of views with Mr Guido Raimondi, President of the European Court of Human Rights on the recent activities of the European Court of Human Rights and the cooperation with ECRI.

57. In 2018, ECRI continued its co-operation with other Council of Europe monitoring bodies. On 18-19 June, ECRI took part in a Conference on Minorities and Minority Languages in a Changing Europe to commemorate the 20th anniversary of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities and the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages.

58. The Parliamentary Assembly (PACE) and the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe (the Congress) are represented at ECRI's plenary meetings and contribute to its work. ECRI also submitted comments on Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation 2140 (2018) on "Unlimited access to member States, including 'grey zones', by Council of Europe and United Nations human rights monitoring bodies".

59. At its 77th plenary meeting (4-7 December 2019), ECRI held an exchange of views with key Council of Europe staff members, namely Mr Jeroen Schokkenbroek, Director, Directorate of Anti-discrimination, on the working themes of his Directorate and with Ms Irena Guidikova, Head of Division, Inclusion and Anti-discrimination

programmes on the programme of "intercultural cities" of which she is in charge. ECRI's Chair took part in the No Hate Speech Movement Youth Campaign Evaluation Conference, which took place from 10-11 April 2018 in Strasbourg.

60. In 2018, ECRI participated in two events organised as part of the joint programme between the Council of Europe and the European Union "Horizontal Facility for Western Balkans and Turkey", in the context of one of the programme's three themes, namely combating discrimination and protecting the rights of vulnerable groups. The first was a high-level regional conference organised in Sarajevo on 15-16 February on "Strengthening the Human Rights Ombudsman to fight Discrimination", and the second was a Regional Conference on "Tolerant and Inclusive Societies in the Western Balkans" held on 14-15 November 2018 in Podgorica.

61. In general, ECRI is regularly updated on the work of other Council of Europe bodies dealing with issues related to racism and intolerance. ECRI's Secretariat provides these bodies with information on ECRI's activities.

United Nations

Universal Periodic Review (UPR)

62. In 2018, ECRI contributed to the 31st, 32nd and 33rd sessions of the Universal Periodical Review with its country reports and interim follow up conclusions.

UN Conventions

63. ECRI reports make regular reference to the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD). ECRI also calls upon states that have not yet made a declaration under Article 14 of ICERD, enabling individuals and groups of individuals to file petitions before the UN Committee for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD), to do so.

Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR)

64. ECRI is regularly invited to participate in various meetings organised by the OHCHR and to submit contributions based on its monitoring and thematic work. Similarly OHCHR staff members are regularly invited to ECRI's events. The participation of a representative of the Anti-Racial Discrimination Section of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights at the

ECRI conference on the revised version of ECRI General Policy Recommendation No. 2 on Equality Bodies offered the opportunity to both bodies to share their experience on this question.

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO)

65. ECRI's first Vice-Chair attended an International Conference on Cultural Diversity held on 26-27 November 2018 at the University of Macedonia in Thessaloniki, on the topic of "Human Rights and Cultural Diversity", co-organised by the UNESCO Chair of Intercultural Policy of the University of Macedonia, Greece, the UNESCO Chair on Women, Peace and Security, of the University of Macedonia, the UNESCO Chair of Education on Human Rights, Democracy and Peace, of the Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, the Jean Monnet Centre of Excellence on European Constitutional Law and Religion at the Law School, Aristotle University of Thessaloniki and the Jean Monnet Chair on Policies of Education, Training, Research and Innovation in the EU.

United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR)

66. ECRI has a close working relationship with UNHCR, facilitated by the UNHCR Representation to the European Institutions in Strasbourg. ECRI regularly receives input from UNHCR concerning its country visits, round tables and various legal issues.

Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE)

67. ECRI and the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) continued to involve each other in their conferences and meetings. OSCE/ODIHR is systematically invited to and attends ECRI's national round tables and ECRI contributes regularly to OSCE/ODIHR meetings.

68. ECRI and ODIHR continued to involve each other in their conferences and meetings. For example, ODIHR's Adviser on Combating Racism and Xenophobia attended ECRI's Equality Bodies' annual seminar (Strasbourg, 24 May), which was devoted to the launching of ECRI General Policy Recommendation No. 2 on Equality Bodies to combat racism and intolerance at national level and discussing and sharing experience among representatives of

national equality bodies on good practices in combating hate speech (see paragraph 50. above). ECRI participated in a Conference on “Combating Intolerance and Discrimination, with a Focus on Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief: Towards a Comprehensive Response in the OSCE Region”, held in Rome on 22 October.

69. ECRI and ODIHR continue to work closely on improving state and civil society responses to hate crime, an area of common interest also in the context of ECRI’s fifth monitoring cycle, which focuses inter alia on hate speech and racist violence. The two bodies co-operate and benefit from each other’s expertise and initiatives in this area. ODIHR systematically refers to ECRI’s country-by-country reports and General Policy Recommendations. ECRI uses ODIHR’s hate crime data in all its country monitoring reports. ODIHR provided input to ECRI’s revised General Policy Recommendation No. 2 on Equality Bodies to combat racism and intolerance at national level published on 27 February 2018 and the secretariats of the ODIHR and ECRI also collaborated on a document on the delineation of hate crime and hate speech.

70. ODIHR and ECRI are also active members of the Subgroup on methodologies for Recording and Collecting Data on Hate Crime, established as part of the European Commission’s High Level Group to Combat Racism, Xenophobia and Other Forms of Intolerance and led by EU Fundamental Rights Agency. The mission of the Subgroup is to develop principles for hate crime recording applicable in EU member States, and assist in their national implementation.

European Union

European Commission

71. The Directorate of Equality and Union Citizenship of the Directorate-General (DG) Justice and Consumers of the European Commission and ECRI’s Secretariat keep each other informed of important developments in their work and exchange information on subjects of common interest.

Fundamental Rights Agency (FRA)

72. Cooperation between ECRI and FRA continued in 2018 ECRI’s reports make regular reference to FRA’s work. ECRI continued to provide inputs to the preparation of FRA’s annual report and FRA provided inputs to the preparation of ECRI’s country

reports. Throughout the year ECRI participated actively in several events organised by FRA, such as meetings of the sub-group on methodologies for recording and collecting data on hate crimes. ECRI participated in the Fundamental Rights Forum 2018 – Open session: The Fight against Hate Speech Can Be Won: New Developments in Europe held on 25-27 September 2018 in Vienna.

World Bank Group

73. ECRI took part in the Commemoration of the International Day against Homophobia, Transphobia and Biphobia (IDAHOT) organised by the World Bank Group and the Austrian Federal Ministry for Europe, Integration, and Foreign Affairs in Vienna on 17 May 2018.

Joint statement

74. ECRI, FRA and the OSCE/ODIHR issued a joint statement on 21 March 2018 to mark the international day for the elimination of racial discrimination. This statement emphasised the importance of strong, effective and independent equality bodies, which can play an essential role in combating racism and discrimination.

Appendix I – Membership of ECRI⁹

Name	Member in respect of	Term of office expires
Ms Arzu AGHDASI-SISAN	Azerbaijan	31 December 2022
Mr Christian ÅHLUND	Sweden	24 May 2020
Mr Sinisa BJEKOVIC	Montenegro	9 December 2023
Mr Thomas BÜCHEL	Liechtenstein	27 May 2019
Mr Patrice DAVOST	Monaco	6 December 2020
Mr Régis de GOUTTES	France	16 September 2019
Mr Vitaliano ESPOSITO	Italy	31 December 2022
Mr Michael FARRELL	Ireland	29 November 2021
Ms Inês FERREIRA LEITE	Portugal	25 September 2023
Mr Saša GAJIN	Serbia	6 November 2022
Ms Domenica GHIDEI BIIDU	Netherlands	7 October 2020
Ms Sara GIMÉNEZ GÍMENEZ	Spain	31 December 2022

⁹ All tables in this appendix reflect the situation on 31 December 2018.

Name	Member in respect of	Term of office expires
Mr Richard GIRAGOSIAN	Armenia	25 September 2023
Ms Helena HOFMANNOVÁ	Czech Republic	31 December 2022
Ms Vasilika HYSI	Albania	31 December 2022
Ms Irena IVIEVA	Bulgaria	31 December 2022
Ms Barbara JOHN	Germany	31 December 2022
Mr Ögmundur JONASSON	Iceland	31 December 2022
Mr Imre JUHÁSZ	Hungary	31 December 2022
Mr Cristian JURA	Romania	31 December 2022
Ms Anhelita KAMENSKA	Latvia	25 October 2021
Ms Elżbieta KARSKA	Poland	2 May 2022
Ms Els KEYTSMAN	Belgium	31 December 2022
Ms Neža KOGOVŠEK ŠALAMON	Slovenia	31 December 2022
Mr Volodymyr KULYK	Ukraine	10 December 2023

Name	Member in respect of	Term of office expires
Ms Renee LAIVIERA	Malta	17 November 2019
Mr Jean-Paul LEHNERS	Luxembourg	8 February 2021
Mr Šarūnas LIEKIS	Lithuania	31 December 2022
Ms Ülle MADISE	Estonia	31 December 2022
Ms Maria Daniella MAROUDA	Greece	4 November 2020
Ms Kristina PARDALOS	San Marino	11 December 2023
Mr Andreas PASCHALIDES	Cyprus	31 December 2022
Mr Jacint RIBERAYGUA CAELLES	Andorra	26 September 2021
Ms Elene RUSETSKAIA	Georgia	31 December 2022
Mr Gerald SCHÖPFER	Austria	27 February 2020
Ms Tena ŠIMONOVIĆ EINWALTER	Croatia	1 July 2019
Mr Sergey SOKOLOVSKIY	Russian Federation	31 December 2022
Mr Aslak SYSE	Norway	31 December 2022

Name	Member in respect of	Term of office expires
Mr Kadri Ecvd TEZCAN	Turkey	31 December 2022
Mr Daniel THÜRER	Switzerland	31 December 2018
Ms Reetta TOIVANEN	Finland	1 July 2019
Mr Michal VAŠEČKA	Slovakia	31 December 2022
Mr Jens VEDSTED-HANSEN	Denmark	31 December 2022
Mr Michael WHINE	United Kingdom	25 September 2023
Vacant seat	Bosnia and Herzegovina	
Vacant seat	Republic of Moldova	
Vacant seat	"the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" ¹⁰	

¹⁰ As of 12 February 2019, the official name of "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" changed to North Macedonia.

Deputies to ECRI members

Name	Deputy in respect of	Term of office expires
Ms Doris ANGST	Switzerland	31 December 2018
Ms Costanza HERMANIN	San Marino	31 December 2022
Ms Ketevan KHUTSISHVILI	Georgia	31 December 2022
Ms Renée KOERING-JOULIN	France	16 September 2019
Mr Paul Aarre LAPPALAINEN	Sweden	24 May 2020
Mr Alexis MARQUET	Monaco	6 December 2020
Ms Aránzazu MORETÓN TOQUERO	Spain	31 December 2022
Ms Anna RASTAS	Finland	1 July 2019
Ms Fabienne ROSSLER	Luxembourg	8 February 2021
Mr François SANT'ANGELO	Belgium	31 December 2022
Mr Gjergj SINANI	Albania	31 December 2022

Observers to ECRI

Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe

Mr Titus CORLĂȚEAN

Mr Bertrand SORRE

Mr Damien THIÉRY

Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe

Mr Varinder Singh BOLA

Holy See

Mr Jean-Pierre MACHELON

European Commission

Ms Barbara NOLAN

Mr Szabolcs SCHMIDT

Mexico

Ms Alexandra HAAS PACIUC

ECRI's Bureau

Mr Jean-Paul LEHNERS
Chair
member in respect of Luxembourg

Ms Maria Daniella MAROUDA
Vice-Chair
member in respect of Greece

Ms Reetta TOIVANEN
Vice-Chair
member in respect of Finland

Mr Christian AHLUND
Bureau member
member in respect of Sweden

Mr Siniša BJEKOVIC
Bureau member
member in respect of Montenegro

Mr Michael FARRELL
Bureau member
member in respect of Ireland

Mr Šarūnas LIEKIS
Bureau member
member in respect of Lithuania

Appendix II – Secretariat of ECRI¹¹

Ms Michèle AKIP, Executive Secretary to ECRI
Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 23 46

Mr Stefano VALENTI, External Relations Officer
Tel: +33 (0) 3 90 21 43 28

Ms Camilla TESSENYI, Lawyer
Tel: + 33 (0) 3 88 41 30 29

Mr Thobias BERGMANN, Programme Adviser
Tel: +33 (0) 3 90 21 46 19

Mr Wolfram BECHTEL, Lawyer
Tel: + 33 (0) 3 90 21 58 44

Ms Zeynep USAL KANZLER, Lawyer
Tel.: +33 (0) 3 90 21 63 63

Ms Sophie KURT, Researcher/Project Officer
Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 35 28

Ms Paula ECK-WALTERS, Administrative Assistant
Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 33 99

Ms Sylvia LEHMANN, Assistant
Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 29 64

Ms Maya RASMUSSEN, Assistant
Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 24 02

¹¹ This appendix reflects the situation on 31 December 2018.

Secretariat's address

Directorate General II - Democracy
Directorate of Anti-discrimination
Council of Europe
67075 STRASBOURG CEDEX
France

E-mail Secretariat: ecri@coe.int

Appendix III - Meetings held by ECRI in 2018

Plenary sessions

- 21-23 March 2018
- 19-22 June 2018
- 4-7 December 2018

Bureau meetings

- 17 January 2018
- 20 March 2018
- 18 June 2018
- 12 October 2018
- 3 December 2018

Meetings of the Working Group on relations with civil society and equality bodies

- 20 March 2018
- 18 June 2018
- 3 December 2018

National round table

- Armenia: 27 June 2018

Seminar with Equality Bodies and launching seminar for ECRI's General Policy Recommendation (GPR) No. 2 on Equality Bodies

- 24 May 2018

Meetings of CBC Working Groups

Preparation of contact visits:

- | | |
|----------------|------------------|
| • Belgium: | 7 December 2018 |
| • Finland: | 22 June 2018 |
| • Germany: | 16 November 2018 |
| • Ireland: | 18 May 2018 |
| • Netherlands: | 20 March 2018 |

- Romania: 8 March 2018
- Slovenia: 9 March 2018
- Switzerland: 3 December 2018

Amendments:

- Ireland: 5 December 2018
- Latvia: 19 June 2018
- Republic of Moldova: 21 March 2018
- Netherlands: 4 December 2018
- Portugal: 21 March 2018
- Romania: 5 December 2018
- Russian Federation: 20 June 2018
- Slovenia: 4 December 2018

Interim follow-up:

- Azerbaijan: 7 December 2018
- Cyprus: 6 December 2018
- France: 20 June 2018
- Georgia: 21 June 2018
- Italy: 5 December 2018
- Lithuania: 4 December 2018
- Monaco: 19 June 2018
- ‘the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia’: 5 December 2018
- Turkey: 6 December 2018
- United Kingdom: 7 December 2018

Contact Visits

- Romania: 16-20 April 2018
- Russian Federation: 5-9 February 2018
- Slovenia: 16-20 April 2018
- Finland: 10-14 September 2018
- Ireland: 2-5 July 2018
- Netherlands: 2-6 July 2018

Appendix IV - List of publications¹²

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.1: Combating racism, xenophobia antisemitism and intolerance (Strasbourg, 4 October 1996)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.2: Equality Bodies to combat racism and intolerance at national level (Strasbourg, 7 December 2017)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.3: combating racism and intolerance against Roma/Gypsies (Strasbourg, 6 March 1998)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.4: National surveys on the experience and perception of discrimination and racism from the point of view of potential victims (Strasbourg, 6 March 1998)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.5: Combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims (Strasbourg, 27 April 2000)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.6: Combating the dissemination of racist, xenophobic and antisemitic material via the Internet (Strasbourg, 15 December 2000)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.7: National legislation to combat racism and racial discrimination (Strasbourg, 13 December 2002 and revised on 7 December 2017)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.8: Combating racism while fighting terrorism (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.9: The fight against antisemitism (Strasbourg, 9 September 2004)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.10: Combating racism and racial discrimination in and through school education (Strasbourg, 21 March 2007)

¹² Publications that are out of date no longer figure on this list.

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.11: Combating racism and racial discrimination in policing (Strasbourg, 4 October 2007)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.12: Combating racism and racial discrimination in the field of sport (Strasbourg, 19 March 2009)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.13: Combating anti-Gypsyism and discrimination against Roma (Strasbourg, 19 September 2011)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.14: Combating racism and racial discrimination in employment (Strasbourg, 25 September 2012)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.15: Combating Hate Speech (Strasbourg, 21 March 2016)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.16: Safeguarding irregularly present migrants from discrimination (Strasbourg, 10 May 2016)
- ECRI's country-by-country approach:

→ First round:

- Volume I (Strasbourg, September 1997)
- Volume II (Strasbourg, March 1998)
- Volume III (Strasbourg, 15 June 1998)
- Volume IV (Strasbourg, 26 January 1999)
- Volume V (Strasbourg, 13 March 1999)
- Volume VI (Strasbourg, 24 May 1999)
- Volume VII (Strasbourg, 9 November 1999)

→ Second round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)

- Belgium (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 3 March 2001)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Finland (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- France (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Ireland (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- Republic of Moldova (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- The Netherlands (Strasbourg, 13 November 2001)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 4 November 2002)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 13 November 2001)
- San Marino (Strasbourg, 4 November 2003)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- “the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia”
(Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)

- Compilation of second round reports (Strasbourg, February 2004)

→ Third round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Bosnia and Herzegovina (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Finland (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- France (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Ireland (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Republic of Moldova (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Monaco (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- Netherland (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)

- San Marino (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Serbia (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)

→ Fourth round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 9 February 2011)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 31 May 2011)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 26 May 2009)
- Bosnia and Herzegovina (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 24 February 2009)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 25 September 2012)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 31 May 2011)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 15 September 2009)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
- Finland (Strasbourg, 9 July 2014)
- France (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 26 May 2009)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 15 September 2009)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 24 February 2009)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Ireland (Strasbourg, 19 February 2014)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 19 February 2014)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 13 September 2011)

- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 15 October 2014)
- Republic of Moldova (Strasbourg, 15 October 2014)
- Monaco (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
- Montenegro (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Netherlands (Strasbourg, 15 October 2014)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 24 February 2009)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 9 July 2014)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 15 October 2014)
- San Marino (Strasbourg, 9 July 2014)
- Serbia (Strasbourg, 31 May 2011)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 26 May 2009)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 16 September 2014)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 25 September 2012)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 15 September 2009)
- “the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)

→ Follow-up recommendations fourth round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 19 February 2013)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 19 February 2013)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Bosnia and Herzegovina (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 19 February 2013)
- Finland (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)

- France (Strasbourg, 9 July 2013)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 15 October 2013)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 25 September 2012)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Ireland (Strasbourg, 1 March 2016)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 1 March 2016)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 4 October 2016)
- Moldova (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Monaco (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Montenegro (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Netherlands (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 9 July 2013)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 16 May 2017)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- San Marino (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Serbia (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 19 September 2017)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- “The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia”
(Strasbourg, 9 July 2013)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 19 February 2013)

→ Fifth round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 28 February 2017)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 4 October 2016)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 13 October 2015)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Bosnia and Herzegovina (Strasbourg, 28 February 2017)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 16 September 2014)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 15 May 2018)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 13 October 2015)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 16 May 2017)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 13 October 2015)
- France (Strasbourg, 1 March 2016)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 1 March 2016)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 28 February 2017)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 15 May 2018)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 28 February 2017)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 15 May 2018)
- Republic of Moldova (Strasbourg, 2 October 2018)
- Monaco (Strasbourg, 1 March 2016)
- Montenegro (Strasbourg, 19 September 2017)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 2 October 2018)
- San Marino (Strasbourg, 27 February 2018)
- Serbia (Strasbourg, 16 May 2017)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 16 September 2014)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 27 February 2018)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 27 February 2018)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 16 September 2014)
- "The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia"
(Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)

- Turkey (Strasbourg, 4 October 2016)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 19 September 2017)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 4 October 2016)

→ Follow-up recommendations fifth round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 15 May 2018)
 - Austria (Strasbourg, 15 May 2018)
 - Belgium (Strasbourg, 28 February 2017)
 - Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 16 May 2017)
 - Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 15 May 2018)
 - Estonia (Strasbourg, 15 May 2018)
 - Germany (Strasbourg, 28 February 2017)
 - Greece (Strasbourg, 27 February 2018)
 - Hungary (Strasbourg, 15 May 2018)
 - Norway (Strasbourg, 27 February 2018)
 - Poland (Strasbourg, 15 May 2018)
 - Slovak Republic (Strasbourg, 16 May 2017)
 - Switzerland (Strasbourg, 16 May 2017)
- Proceedings of the Seminar “Combating racism while respecting freedom of expression”, 16 -17 November 2006 (Strasbourg, July 2007)
 - “Ethnic” statistics and data protection in the Council of Europe countries, by Patrick Simon, *Institut National d’Etudes Démographiques* (Strasbourg, November 2007)
 - “Cooperation for effectiveness: Local authorities and national specialised bodies combating racism and intolerance” ECRI study by Niall Crowley (Strasbourg, May 2015)
 - “National Specialised Bodies: Effective implementation of their advisory function” ECRI study by Niall Crowley (Strasbourg, December 2016)

